Labor Market Integration of Immigrants, Refugees, and Disadvantaged Groups – A Comparison of Israel and Germany

Final Report

Authors: Andrea Mohoric, Gregor Wendler, Wolfgang Wittig
Research Institute for Vocational Education and Training (f-bb)gGmbH
Stresemannstraße 121
10963 Berlin

Contact person: Andrea Mohoric
Phone: +49(0) 30 4174986-46
E-mail: andrea.mohoric@f-bb.de
Fax: +49(0) 30 4174986-10
Web: www.f-bb.de

Berlin, December 4, 2017

Order by: National Agency Education for Europe at the Federal Institute for Vocational Education and Training (NA at BIBB)

Funded by: Federal Ministry of Education and Research (BMBF)
# Contents

Key messages – summary ................................................................. 4

1. Problem presentation and research thesis ........................................ 6

2. Methodological approach .................................................................. 9

   2.1 Analysis and decision basis for the seminar .................................... 10

   2.2 Seminar preparation and implementation ........................................ 13

   2.3 Seminar documentation and recommendations for action .................. 15

3. Comparative analysis: systemic background and policy structures ........... 15

   3.1 Germany ...................................................................................... 16

       3.1.1 Vocational education and training system ................................ 16

       3.1.2 Immigration situation – historical, legal, current ..................... 18

       3.1.3 Program lines for promoting integration measures ..................... 20

   3.2 Israel .......................................................................................... 23

       3.2.1 Vocational education and training system ................................ 23

       3.2.2 Immigration situation – historical, legal, current ..................... 25

       3.2.3 Program lines for promoting integration measures ..................... 27

4. Comparative analysis: policy areas and measures ................................. 28

   4.1 Germany ...................................................................................... 28

       4.1.1 Vocational orientation and preparation ..................................... 28

       4.1.2 Vocational training ................................................................. 29

       4.1.3 Qualification and vocational further education ............................ 30

       4.1.4 Placement, counseling, and assistance ..................................... 31

   4.2 Israel .......................................................................................... 32

       4.2.1 Vocational orientation and preparation ..................................... 32

       4.2.2 Vocational training ................................................................. 33

       4.2.3 Qualification and vocational further education ............................ 33

       4.2.4 Placement, counseling, and assistance ..................................... 34

4.3 Conclusion of the selection of seminar topics ..................................... 35

   4.3.1 Comparative topics ................................................................. 36
Key messages – summary

A professional exchange of vocational training experts from Germany and Israel within the framework of the program of the German-Israeli vocational training cooperation was the basis for recommendations for the labor market integration of immigrants.

In October 2017, a three-day seminar in Tel Aviv dealt with the concepts of measures and good practice projects of both countries on the topics of language acquisition and vocational preparation as well as counseling / assistance. Experts from the programmatic and operational level of both countries discussed success factors, program structures, and transfer possibilities. Through the scientific analysis in advance and the evaluation afterwards, the seminar could be prepared and documented with pinpoint accuracy. Thus, recommendations for action could be developed from the transfer ideas of the participants.

1. In terms of labor market integration of immigrants and minorities, Germany can learn from Israel.

It is true that the VET system and the immigration policy differ greatly in the two countries: in contrast to the German dual system, Israel has a more school-oriented VET system reserved primarily for a small segment of young people without a higher education entrance qualification and groups with disadvantages in the labor market. However, Israel as an immigration country has much experience in the area of integration of immigrants and (minority) populations. Especially the important phase of language acquisition and vocational preparation as well as the respective counseling and assistance contain interesting approaches and concepts. At the mutual exchange, success factors for successful labor market integration were identified, such as individual educational pathways, flexibility in the application of labor market policy instruments, or a particularly strong demand orientation in the labor market and concerning the needs of immigrants.

2. Enhanced curricular integration of language acquisition into vocational training and company practice

Besides the thematic integration of language courses and vocational training measures, the integration of general and technical language learning is important for success. The early practical application of language skills deepens and broadens the vocabulary, further developing terminology in an operational context. Language practice should be a much bigger part of language learning.

3. Enable access to the labor market and differentiated arrangement of individual educational paths

Instead of a long holding time in the transitional and education system, rapid access to the labor market should be prioritized in the individual case of legal options (right of residence). Short, company-oriented qualifications and further training measures, such as qualification-oriented second chance qualification measures as well as partial qualifications, could moti-
ivate earning money early on and boost the sense of achievement. The consideration of individual educational pathways for immigrants is an important basis. Based on previous professional experience suitable vocational training paths can be designed, depending on individual requirements and interests, vocational training or qualifications in close cooperation with companies and continuing vocational education measures such as second chance qualification and partial qualification. Motivation and a sense of achievement can be strengthened by enabling company practice and employment.

4. **Continuous counseling and assistance by one and the same person**

A lasting coaching, which strengthens the competence of the individual participant and starts at the language course as the first education measure until placement in work, facilitates the transitional and educational process.

5. **Regional and local needs assessment and flexible design of educational offers**

Controlled needs and demands assessment involving the regional economy, the local Employment Agency, and involvement of migrant actors as well as the community’s needs could help meet labor market demands. The flexibility and room for maneuver of existing labor market policy tools can be used more effectively to better respond to local needs and to provide tailor made education.

6. **A participative, culturally-oriented approach in the design of educational measures would do justice to the target groups**

Integration processes need empowerment and participation. Migrant organizations should be more involved in the design and implementation of educational and labor market integrative instruments. The KAUSA approach, which supports migrant companies in training participation, could be further developed and expanded to provide culturally-oriented integrative education.

7. **Qualification offensive for vocational training staff - multiplier training for intercultural didactics**

Intercultural competencies and inclusive cultural-orientated didactics are necessary to be able to focus more on the needs and resources of the immigrants in the educational offers. Educational professionals with a migrant background should be more involved in conceptual design and didactics development in order to use their intercultural competency and to strengthen participation.

8. **Convincing by Good Practice - communication and dissemination**

Role models with a migrant background in various occupational positions, the working world is already diverse and colleagues bring diverse skills, good examples of immigrants in occupational training - all these successes should be communicated and disseminated sufficiently, to produce more conviction and positive arguments for integration to create immigrants.
9. **Strengthen support of the companies**

At the interface of apprenticeship placement, the coordination can be intensified to create more seamless transitions. There are successful examples of what support and assistance companies need to attract immigrants. These concepts should be further developed and promoted.

10. **Interdisciplinary, interinstitutional stakeholder for holistic management of the need for action and solutions**

The experience of expert exchanges across ministries, agencies, and institutions, and at local, regional, and national levels has proven to be successful as the holistic view of labor market integration has been strengthened and has contributed to identify key issues and hurdles in program lines and educational approaches as well as action and development needs.

1. **Problem presentation and research thesis**

Subject matter of the present report is the comparison of approaches, policies, and measures on labor market integration of immigrants in Germany and Israel.

With the increase in the number of refugees and asylum seekers in 2015 and 2016, the challenge of integrating people into the training and employment system has increased from a German point of view, because of the different structure of education systems in their countries of origin – an occupational or dual vocational training is not widely used outside the German-speaking countries – therefore, their qualifications cannot be compared with the qualifications provided for in the German VET system and demanded in the German labor market. Against this background, a comparison with Israel is possible, as Israel has integrated immigrants from different regions of the world within the framework of Jewish immigration ("Aliyah") with a correspondingly heterogeneous educational background and, on the other hand, already has a high ethnic-cultural diversity within the established population.

**Research thesis:** Germany can learn from the labor market integration of Israel.

The idea of making a comparison emerged in the context of the German-Israeli vocational training cooperation, which is part of the program for cooperation between the two countries in vocational training, although the different vocational training systems and immigration policies in both countries seem to prohibit a comparison. However, as an immigration country, Israel has extensive experience of integrating heterogeneous immigrant / population groups. How rewarding a comparison is and what Germany can learn is shown by the present study.

At this point, the question arises what is meant by the labor market integration of immigrants. Integration can basically be understood as a process that enables immigrants to participate in the host society through mutual efforts (see Hampshire, 2013, pp. 131-132). The reciprocity of the process is that immigrants conform to the rules of the host society, while...
the latter takes precautions for the full economic, social, cultural, and political participation of immigrants. Accordingly, the literature also distinguishes between economic, social, political, and cultural aspects of integration, from which conflicts of objectives may arise in certain constellations (Hampshire, 2013, pp. 134-136). The present presentation focuses on the economic dimension of integration, so that the success of integration must be judged on the basis of traditional labor market indicators, such as employment rate and income level. The term "labor market integration" thus describes a process that enables equal participation of immigrants in gainful employment.

The transition to working life is a relatively smooth process for the domestic population under normal conditions, since the process of general and vocational education takes place in the same social context as employment. The situation is different for immigrants who, due to their biographical distance from the qualification standards of the host country, have particular disadvantages in the labor market. In addition to a low, missing, or not readily recognized vocational qualification, inadequate language skills are to be seen as an obstacle to integration, which disproportionately affects refugees and asylum seekers in Germany (see Bonin / Rinne 2017, p. 20). Formally low-skilled and immigrants have particular difficulties to be integrated into the labor market and thus into society as a whole; they are, therefore, the focus of the study.

At this point, it needs to be clarified who exactly is meant when talking about immigrants in general and refugees in particular. The focus is on people migrating to Germany after fleeing from oppression or violence in their countries of origin. In the context of this so-called flight migration, three status groups are distinguished: Refugees (or "protection beneficiaries") are refugees recognized under the Geneva Convention or have received political asylum under the German constitution. Asylum seekers are persons whose asylum application has not yet been decided. Persons who are tolerated have not been recognized as refugees, but they cannot be expelled to their countries of origin for various reasons (see OECD 2017, p. 17). Other persons with a migration background, i.e. those who either immigrated into Germany on their own via one of the other entry routes (see chapter 3.1.2) or who have at least one immigrant parent, are also taken into consideration as far as they are affected by similar difficulties concerning their access to training and employment.

The contemplated measures to promote the labor market integration of immigrants can be divided into two categories, although the allocation in this particular case can be difficult, as there is overlap between the two, and a differentiation in these cases can only be made concerning the institutional responsibility. The more important category in this analysis is vocational training. This term entails all measures which are primarily aimed at qualification for the labor market through the provision of professional knowledge and skills. This includes,
in the first instance, vocational training and continuing vocational training, as well as vocational preparation, which is also concerned with vocational learning processes. The second group of measures that effectively shape integration policy are labor market services, among which such activities are explored that are less focused on the qualification of immigrants than on the promotion of the utilization of existing vocational qualifications. In addition to classical counseling and mediation, this also includes offers for the recognition of professional qualifications acquired abroad as well as making non-formal and informally acquired competencies visible. Qualification measures for the unemployed, however, are also typically included in this category, so the distinction between vocational training is not entirely clear. In addition to the sponsoring body, the fact that such training measures do not aim at a complete vocational qualification is considered as a further distinguishing feature.

Vocational education and training can be further categorized by describing and systematizing its content orientation as well as its organizational structure on the basis of comparable features. An example of the classification according to content criteria is the distinction of "professionalism" and "employability" as a major issue of training as formulated by Rauner (2006). If the former refers to the situation in which the vocational learning processes are based on comprehensive occupational images and are aimed at the development of genuinely professional identity and capacity for action, the latter means the need-based acquisition of specific knowledge and skills which are not standardized on an industry-wide scale, but fit the specific needs of employers and workplaces. The well-known distinction between on-the-job and dual training on the one hand and full-time training on the other is an example of a classification based on the formal organization.

Against this background, the measures taken in both countries in VET and labor market policies to support the integration of immigrants into the employment system - and ultimately their social integration - are therefore considered from the perspective of their transferability. The aim of the study is to determine which conceptual approaches are pursued, what experiences have been made with regard to the success of integration, and what conclusions can be drawn from them with regard to the further development of integration policy instruments in Germany.

The central research questions are therefore:

- What are the basics for labor market integration of immigrants and refugees in Germany and Israel?
- What new perspectives on options for labor market integration of immigrants and refugees can be gained from both countries?

This results in the following in-depth core questions:

- What is the current socio-political understanding in Israel and Germany regarding immigration and securing skilled labor?
• How did the respective VET system react to the challenge? Which suitable outstanding good practice approaches and concepts are worth a comparative analysis? What support is offered to immigrants and companies?

• What are the similarities and differences, particularly with regard to counseling / guidance, the didactic implementation of vocational preparation and vocational training and the integrating elements (language, culture) of immigrants, and the involvement of companies in this qualification process and the subsequent placement of immigrants into employment?

• What can Germany learn from Israel? Which elements of the respective approaches in Israel and Germany refer to synergy effects in terms of systems and practice of VET and which transfer / transfer possibilities arise from this?

• Which substantive consequences and educational recommendations for action follow from this?

For this purpose, a multi-day seminar between Israel and Germany on the topic of labor market integration of immigrants and disadvantaged groups in both countries should be prepared with a well-founded analysis, and possibilities for action should be followed up in a final report. The host and organizer of the seminar in Tel Aviv is the Manpower Training and Development Bureau (MTDB) at the Israeli Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs and Services as a cooperation partner in the German-Israeli Program for Cooperation in Vocational Education and Training, and the NA at BIBB with support by the Research Institute for Vocational Education and Training (f-bb).

2. Methodological approach

The following explains the methods and instruments for the preparation, implementation and follow-up of the seminar, which are divided into three phases:

Analysis and basis for decision for the seminar

Seminar preparation and implementation

Seminar documentation and recommendations for action
2.1 Analysis and decision basis for the seminar

In the run-up to the seminar, a basis for decision was formulated, which the BMBF and the contracting authority NA at BIBB should give as the foundation for the negotiations with the Israeli partner (MTDB) in order to plan a seminar that is interesting and expedient for both sides.

Matrix

The German side explicitly wanted the seminar to include a practical exchange of good practice projects. Accordingly, a matrix (see synopses), which should ensure the identification of such projects and measures in both countries, was clarified by and agreed with the contracting authority.

In order to achieve a common structure and comparability, the respective surveys of the countries were examined with the same analytical criteria. This approach provided an opportunity to identify synergy points that involved both strong consensus and strong differences. From this, possibilities of transfer could be derived.

For the comparability of projects, approaches, and concepts for the (occupational) labor market integration of immigrants and refugees in Germany and Israel, a list of criteria was chosen that is closely related to the practical implementation of measures. The analysis criteria of the synergy points concern: barriers and entry requirements for immigrants, role and involvement of companies in internships and training phases, course concept and curriculum, didactics, occupational fields and labor market needs, competency assessment in advance and at the completion of the measures, sponsorship and financing as well as justification for selection as good practice. The measures / projects were subdivided according to educational and labor policy fields of action: vocational preparation, vocational training as well as vocational guidance and counseling and accompanying offers.

Country analysis and synopses on labor market integration measures

The analysis of the federal states (German “Länder”) provides an overview of the different vocational training systems and the current immigration situation with regard to historical and legal developments in the federal states. Furthermore, the program lines and measures to support labor market integration are considered.

The measures taken by the German and Israeli sides were each put together in the form of a synopsis (see synopses Germany and Israel). The synopses of both countries are organized according to the fields of action mentioned above. The types of measures are assigned to the vertical categories of the analysis matrix, and the descriptions thereof are given in the horizontal categories of the analysis matrix. The compilation of measures and offers was based on literature and documents. It was assumed that the information about measures and offers from the Israeli side was available in English. The Israeli synopsis relies mainly on accessible sources on the Internet, which are available in English. Further source material on the operational level of the project and measure implementation as well as the background literature
of the Israeli contributions could partially obtained from the Israeli speakers after the seminar. This means that the Israeli synopsis is limited to the description of the measure. Only a few good practice examples could be found in advance. Good practice in language acquisition could only be identified within the Ulpan system, which contain several suggestions in the synopsis. Further good practice measures were provided by the Israeli partner MTDB as part of the concrete seminar preparation.

With good source material and knowledge of the measures as well as project landscape on the German side and references from the literature on the most effective measures of labor market integration of refugees and other immigrants, the most important offers of the currently relevant labor market policy measures could be described. In addition, several good practice examples are identified.

The German projects / measures can be easily categorized here, with the exception of the KAUSA service center, which covers a broader spectrum - from career orientation to accompaniment - and looks after both refugees and companies. The assignment of the Israeli measures was made according to a recognizable focus. The thematic assignment of Israeli types of measures is difficult, as it offers a total package of education and advice / support, whereas in Germany the measures are more likely to be divided into education or counseling services and individual measures. In order to ensure comparability here as well, the Israeli projects and measures are partly assigned to several topics.

It must be acknowledged that the matrix was ultimately designed with the German view and the structure of labor market policy programs and measures in place in Germany.

Conclusions for the orientation of the seminar - Topics and issues of the draft agenda
The seminar proposal focused on a broad selection of topics that had a capacity for comparison in both countries. The focus of this seminar proposal was to highlight topics of comparability, which possess synergies and possibilities of transfer. Priority was given to topics where Germany can learn a lot from Israel. Irrespective of the length of the seminar, equally interesting alternative topics are named, which may also include learning from each other. In addition, alternatives were compiled: the contents of the topic units and the assignment of types of measures.

Comparative topics:

• Language integration of immigrants
• vocational orientation
• vocational preparation
• Consultation / accompaniment of participants and / or companies

General topics:

• Introduction - Occupational integration of immigrants
• Recognition of qualifications
• VET staff and methodology / didactics of cultural differences / inclusion in the occupational integration of immigrants

Many options were given for defining the actual topics of the seminar with the Israeli partner.

The draft agenda also included:
• General questions for the seminar on synergies and transfer in comparative topics
• The question of the joint units were intended to be in an open discussion and a professional exchange that argues challenges, difficulties, "core issues," as well as problems and exploratory movements
• A Selection of good practice examples per topic and the respective speakers

In addition, a selection of speakers and seminar participants from Germany was submitted, most of which included more than one alternative expert. In the proposal list of the participants of the seminar care it was made sure to have a balanced range of stakeholders with high-level experts from the thematic focus of the planned seminar. Experts represented the programmatic as well as the operational level. Priority in the choosing of experts was given regarding the experience in the field of the seminar topic and also the international competence or international project experience.

**Methodological suggestions**
Without intervening in the methodical-didactic preparation and implementation of the seminar, methods were also proposed that structure and prepare the substantive discussion, bring time savings, allow interaction and contribute to the visualization and documentation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Instrument / Method</th>
<th>Objective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Expression of interest</td>
<td>With this, the participants apply to express their expertise and aptitude to participate. In addition, a mini-CV and a photo should be contributed for a detailed participant list (including speaker), so that no lengthy introductory round is necessary.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map: activity to get to know each other</td>
<td>This method is interactive and suitable for getting to know the participants in an entertaining way. Along with questions, which have to do with the seminar, the participants stand up and position themselves in the room.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fact sheet</td>
<td>This analysis should be presented in a short and easy-to-read format, which was prepared for the participants prior to the seminar.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project profile - structure</td>
<td>For a better understanding of the good practice contributions of both countries, they are made available in a structured brief presentation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research form</td>
<td>At the project visits impressions from the practice were presented and project managers were acquainted. A small questionnaire was</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.2 Seminar preparation and implementation

The methodological proposals were accepted by both partners. These structured instruments were mostly of use in the seminar. The coordinated content-related seminar program (see seminar program) focused on two topics: language acquisition and vocational preparation. While the first day of the seminar was dominated by lectures from Germany, Israeli projects were dealt with on the second day. The third day of the seminar consisted of a visit to a training center and a final discussion with MTDB staff as well as a cultural program.

Preparation and get-together of participants

The application form for the seminar, which allowed participants to provide information about their professional background and organizational affiliation, their expertise and their interest in the seminar, was submitted by all German speakers and participants and made available to all attendants. From the Israeli side there was a list with the names, organizations and functions of the participants. Regrettably, no further information could be supplied.

The results of the comparative analysis were condensed in a fact sheet on Germany and Israel (see fact sheet), which was sent to all participants in advance. In addition, five project fiches on the projects to be discussed at the seminar were distributed among the participants (see project profiles).

The map activity to get to know each other was used in short form at the beginning of the seminar, so that the participants could at least vaguely assign faces and countries.

Content-related preparation of the German speakers

A briefing for the five German speakers took place, which contained content-related questions and time constraints for their presentation. For two speakers it also contained a specification for the structuring of profiles of the projects to be presented by them. For insight, all speakers had been provided with a condensate of the analysis of both countries.

Moderation plan / guide

The moderation guide in particular served to ensure visualization and documentation as well as to ensure the development of recommendations for action. Therefore, the moderation guide with its methodological suggestions aimed at:

- Initiate interaction between the 50 participants by facilitating discussions in small groups. The open discussion of the participants should be steered with targeted ques-
tions in order to arrive at results relevant to transfer and the recommendations for action.

- The discussion phases of the seminar were divided into three steps: 1. Analysis and comparison, 2. Solutions to identified difficulties, 3. Investigation of solutions in terms of transferability.

The moderator of the seminar was the host organization MTDB’s own L. Zyser-Yogev. It was agreed in advance that the moderation plan should be followed as much as possible, since the methodological concept aimed at recommendations for action as a seminar result.

The Research Institute for Vocational Education and Training (f-bb) took over the role of the support in the background during the on-site seminar and ensured:

- Visualization of structured recordings of the discussions by writing cards for documentation
- Notes of the discussion based on the participants’ questions and answers were put on colored cards, which were then clustered
- Photographic documentation of the seminar
- Conducting interviews with key figures from ministries, chambers, educational service providers and others of both countries on the perspective of transfer and recommendations for action

For this purpose presentation slides were prepared with questions for the discussion rounds, structural images for the Metaplan board, an exploration sheet for the project visits, and a questionnaire for the key figures, as well as seminar equipment and technical prerequisites that had to be clarified in advance.

*Actual situation during the seminar and subsequent improvisation*

In the practical implementation of the seminar, as is often the case in a complex event of this kind, deviations from the original planning emerged, because the expectations and individual prerequisites of the participants could not be fully anticipated. Due to time constraints not all prepared instruments could be used as planned, so that at certain times improvised procedure was necessary. These deviations were as follows:

- Ultimately, it turned out that no Ulpan language concept was presented as planned. The Israeli presentations were made available upon arrival or during the seminar. However, inquiries by the German participants provided information about language acquisition.
- Israeli participants were present on the first day to hear and discuss the German presentations. On the second day of the project visits, the German participants were among themselves. Although, for this reason it was not possible to interview other
key figures on the Israeli side, conversations with the staff of the MTDB were recorded during and after the seminar.

- Local operations were in the hands of the host, who had put together an ambitious program. The interesting project visits, which provided exciting insights, did not allow sufficient time to carry out the discussion rounds according to the moderation guidelines in a planned manner. Therefore, the bus rides were used to capture impressions and comparisons of the German participants.

- In order to investigate the questions regarding transfer options and recommendations for action, statements were collected as questionnaires (notes on the bus), e-mails after the seminar, and interviews of German participants were recorded on the bus.

- Due to the strong interest and dedication of the participating German experts, breaks and evenings were used for a professional exchange. A structured organized exchange of the German participants, e.g. in advance in Germany or as an independent sequence at the beginning of the seminar could be included as an improvement proposal.

2.3 Seminar documentation and recommendations for action

The contents of the seminar documentation are in particular all of the presentations from Germany and Israel, as well as the existing and the extended project profiles of the on-site visits.

Starting points for developing recommendations for action can ultimately be traced back to photo reports of the visualized discussion (see photo protocol) and transcripts of the key messages of the final discussion as well as the statements of the German participants and the MTDB employees.

The planned different levels of discussions and specializations regarding the assessment of transfer options and recommendations for action could not be carried out to the extent that was planned. In this respect, the indications from the discussion and the statements on the level of comparison related to differences and other ways of dealing with obstacles, difficulties, and experiences perceived on the German side at the program and project level of the participating actors.

3. Comparative analysis: systemic background and policy structures

The following section analyzes the framework conditions for integration with regard to the vocational education and training system and the immigration situation and the program lines for promoting integration measures.
3.1 Germany

3.1.1 Vocational education and training system

The German system of vocational training follows the tradition of apprenticeship training and is geared towards a genuinely professional, non-company training. Unlike in the apprenticeship training of earlier centuries, during which the apprentices had to perform services free of charge for the master or even had to pay a tuition fee, the trainees are now remunerated. The "dual system" of the linking of practical training in the company’s work process and accompanying technical teaching in the part-time vocational school, which since the 1870s has formed with the establishment of trade schools to complement the artisanship, has existed in its mature form since the 1920s. But only since 1969, with the establishment of the Vocational Training Act (BBiG) is existent on a uniform legal basis (see Greinert 2007).

The Vocational Training Act provides the legal basis for the company part of vocational training in the dual system. It describes the essential provisions on the role of vocational training, the requirements for training regulations, the suitability of training companies, guidelines for training contracts, and the role of stakeholders, such as businesses, chambers, and supervisory authorities. According to § 1 (3) BBiG, the goal of vocational education and training is to provide knowledge and skills needed for the completion of a profession. These constitute, in their entirety, the trainee’s professional capacity to act, which can be regarded as the main objective of the training. Vocational training, thus, fulfills a dual purpose, since it serves, on the one hand, to ensure a sufficient supply of skilled labor for the labor market and, on the other hand, pursues the pedagogical purpose of the development of professional identity as part of the personality development.

This finding is confirmed in the examination of the vocational school part of the dual vocational training. The vocational school part is not covered by the Vocational Training Act or other federal laws, but rather regulated in school laws of the federal states. The framework curricula for vocational school teaching in the individual professions are jointly developed by the federal states under the umbrella of the Standing Conference of Ministers of Education and Cultural Affairs (Kultusministerkonferenz KMK). According to the KMK’s guidelines on the development of framework curricula, the task of the vocational school is to provide comprehensive competency that enables the appropriate and responsible management of occupational and social situations. Furthermore, the trainees are to develop the ability to shape the working world and society in social, economic and environmental responsibility (see KMK 2011, p. 13-15). In its entirety, the dual system in the sense of the above categories primarily follows the logic of vocational training in the sense that it seeks the integration of trainees into a particular profession. The regulations (training regulations and framework curricula) are always based on occupational profiles. It is also expected that the apprentices will have the opportunity to pursue their profession independently when they have completed their training. However, the above comments on the vocational training curriculum
also show that, alongside this professional element, the idea of civic education plays a major role in both components of the dual system.

With regard to the legislative powers and control of the training, the dual system presents itself as a zone of shared responsibility of the federal government and state governments. This is clear from the above-described distribution of tasks for creating filing systems used by the relevant ministries on the one hand and the KMK on the other, and whose coordination is regulated in the Memorandum of Understanding of 1972. A reorganization of professions can take place at the initiative of the social partners, the federal government or the state governments. The Chambers of Industry and Commerce as well as the Chambers established for other industries are the "competent authorities" (§ 71 BBiG) for the monitoring of vocational training on the ground. They are responsible for the registration of the training contracts (§ 34 BBiG), the verification of the suitability of training enterprises (§ 32 BBiG), the performance of professional final examinations (§ 39 BBiG), and the advising of in-company training enterprises (§ 76 BBiG).

VET is conducted in accordance with § 2 para. 1 BBiG in companies or similar enterprises, vocational schools, and if necessary in intercorporate training facilities. A minimum scope of in-company training is not required, but the proportion can be inferred from the guidelines for vocational school teaching. According to the agreement between the KMK and the vocational school (KMK 2015), the scope of vocational training is calculated as 12 hours per week, which means that the company’s share of the training can be estimated to be around 70% on the basis of a 40-hour week. The precise distribution varies between the different training professions. The training contract is based on a training contract concluded between the trainee and the company, which, in addition to the training objective, regulates the duration of the training as well as the remuneration and leave entitlement of the trainee (§§ 10, 11 BBiG) is registered. In its entirety, the system presents itself as an extremely complex one, but no need for a fundamental reorganization of competencies has been identified in the ongoing evaluation of the Vocational Training Act.

In practice, vocational training in the dual system continues to be the dominant form of vocational qualification outside the higher education system. Trainees of the dual system account for around 70% of all participants in vocational education and training in Germany (see Statistisches Bundesamt 2015); the rest comes from other branches of training, such as the full-time vocational training courses under state law or providing training for specific professions such as nursing professions. A specific target group is not defined – historically, the apprenticeship training represented the usual way into the working world for the majority of the population (see Greinert 2007) until the time of the educational expansion of the 1960s and 1970s. Today, the dual vocational training is, in principle, still open to everyone. Empirically, the majority of trainees (60%) are between 18 and 24 years old (see Federal Statistical Office 2015). In terms of initial education, the largest group consists of apprentices with a secondary school certificate (42.4%), while 26.2% have university entrance qualifica-
tions, and 28.1% have a “Hauptschulabschluss” (basic school certificate), which is the minimum entrance requirement for VET (BIBB 2016, p. 161). The high proportion of apprentices with university entrance qualifications is noteworthy, because it underlines the high value and attractiveness of dual vocational training in Germany.

In addition to training, **labor market policy** represents the second column of labor market integration. Similar to VET, this area of integration policy is characterized by the federal structure of Germany and, thus, the presence of operators at the federal and state level (see FIG. OECD 2017, p. 25). As is the case with German federalism, the legal requirements are primarily under authority of the federal level, while the implementation is carried out by state and municipal authorities, but partly also by a federal administration. The central actors at the federal level are the Federal Office for Migration and Refugees (BAMF) and the Federal Agency for Labor (BA). The BAMF is a federal authority supervised by the Federal Ministry of the Interior. Its responsibilities include, on the one hand, the decision on asylum applications and, on the other hand, the promotion of the general and occupational language acquisition of refugees by means of corresponding courses offered by BAMF-approved educational institutions on the ground. The Federal Agency for Labor, which is under the supervision of the Federal Ministry of Labor, Social Service and Affairs, is the central service provider for labor market services and supports the job search as well as the development of professional competencies. It is divided into ten regional directorates with a total of 156 employment agencies, which are responsible for the implementation of labor market policy measures and the provision of services at the regional or local level. In addition to the employment agencies, there are 303 Jobcenters in sole municipal responsibility or in collaboration with the employment agencies. Jobcenters are responsible for the benefits for unemployed people outside the unemployment insurance system, including the recognized asylum seekers, and is, therefore, in practice, the primary contact point for the support of refugees in the integration into the labor market.

### 3.1.2 Immigration situation – historical, legal, current

**Immigration**: In the first decades of its existence, the Federal Republic of Germany did not regard itself as an immigration country. The influx of larger population groups in the first years after the end of the Second World War was almost exclusively the entry of Germans, who had been expelled from the former Eastern territories. After the end of this first wave of immigration, which had already been largely completed before the constitution came into force, the Federal Law of Displaced People of 1953 created a permanent legal basis for the admission of German "emigrants" ("Aussiedler") from Central and Eastern European countries. Until the beginning of political transformation in the countries of the Eastern bloc, the number of immigrants remained low: Between 1950 and 1987 a total of 1.4 million emigrants were registered in West Germany. With the opening of the borders, the figures rose and reached its peak with nearly 400,000 people in 1990. Since then, the number of immigrants
from this group has been steadily declining and is now only a few thousand a year (see Seifert 2012).

An influx of third-country nationals in the course of the labor migration started in the middle of the 1950s with the recruitment of so-called guest workers from countries of the Mediterranean area. Against the backdrop of the skills shortage, corresponding recruitment agreements were concluded among others with Italy (1955), Spain (1960), Turkey (1961), and then Yugoslavia (1967). Immigration over this access route accelerated from 1961 onwards, when the influx of workers from the then GDR was interrupted by border closure. After the start of the oil crisis in 1973, recruitment of workers from countries outside the then European Economic Community (EEC) was stopped. By this time, around 4 million foreigners had immigrated to the Federal Republic in this way. As the duration of the stay increased, there was also family reunification in Germany, which nearly compensated the return of guest workers to the recruiting countries (see Seifert 2012).

The right of asylum for politically persecuted persons and the admission of refugees developed from 1990s onwards as a quantitatively significant part of immigration. While during the Cold War, only a few people from Eastern European countries - interrupted by major immigration waves after the Hungarian uprising of 1956, the defeat of the Prague Spring in 1968, and the imposition of war law in Poland in 1981 - applied for political asylum in Germany, number of applicants drastically increased after the fall of the Iron Curtain to a peak of 438,000 in 1992. The following revision of the asylum law, which now excludes the granting of asylum from a safe country of origin or a safe third country, has reduced the annual number of applications to well below 100,000, until the beginning of the so-called refugee crisis (see Seifert 2012).

A systematic immigration and integration policy was not practiced until the late 1990s. While immigration of EU citizens - the EU internal migration represented the most significant form of immigration to Germany before the beginning of the mass influx of refugees and asylum seekers - is already covered by the freedom of movement guaranteed by the European Union, the immigration and labor market integration of third-country citizens has seen policy provisions in the past 15 years that provide different options for the access to the labor market by qualified immigrants (see Hinte / Rinne / Zimmermann 2015, pp. 4-10).

In the segment of direct immigration, the current immigration law provides a series of immigration paths for skilled workers and highly qualified persons, which are described below.

- Skilled workers, i.e. people with a qualified vocational training, may obtain a residence permit to take up employment according to Article 18 (4) of the Residence Act (AufenthG). The corresponding procedure is specified in § 6 of the Employment Ordinance (BeschV). According to this clause, the Federal Employment Agency may give its consent to the commencement of employment if the applicant has completed a domestic vocational training program of at least two years (§ 6 para. 1 BeschV) or if, in the case of a foreign professional qualification, the equivalence with a German de-
agree has been established and the work placement has been agreed upon with the labor market authority in the country of origin (§ 6 para. 2 no. 1 BeschV), or the Federal Employment Agency has established that the permission to work is reasonable with regard to the labor market and integration policy (§ 6 para. 2 no. 2 BeschV). The latter is currently standardized on the so-called "positive list" of shortage jobs, in which the labor market needs cannot be met by German applicants. In all cases, proof of a specific job offer is a prerequisite for the granting of the residence permit (§ 18 para. 5 AufenthG).

- Highly qualified - in particular, scientists with special professional knowledge and teachers in a prominent position - can obtain a branch permit according to § 19 AufenthG; the consent of the Federal Agency for Employment is not required (§ 2 para. 1 BeschV).

- The EU Blue Card, introduced by the Council Directive 2009/50/EC of 25 May 2009, which serves as a means of entry for the purpose of highly qualified employment, has been transposed into national law by Section 19a of the Residence Act. Holders of a university degree, and persons with an equivalent qualification obtained by at least five years' professional experience can, with the consent of the Federal Agency for Labor (in some cases even without its consent), be granted a blue card EU for a long-term stay as long as four years.

Further ways of access concern the issuing of residence titles for the purpose of research as well as the pursuit of self-employment (§§ 20, 21 AufenthG). However, these are of little relevance to the present presentation and are, therefore, not dealt with further. Overall, however, the above-described acquisition of third-country nationals is quantitatively insignificant compared to the forms of immigration for other reasons (flight / asylum, family reunion, entry for educational purposes) (see Hinte / Rinne / Zimmermann 2015, pp. 9-10).

In 2015 and 2016, the immigration of fugitives and asylum seekers has developed into the most significant form of immigration to Germany. In these two years, there were around 1.2 million applicants for asylum, 700,000 of whom are estimated to have a perspective to stay and, therefore, have to be permanently integrated into the labor market (see OECD 2017, p. 15). Typically, as shown by international comparisons, the participation of this group of persons remains behind that of the local population and, at the same time, far behind their own ambitions, for which, in addition to a low or a lack of formal qualification, inadequate language skills are the main reason (cf. Bonin / Hinte 2017, p. 20).

3.1.3 Program lines for promoting integration measures

*Equal opportunities and social participation, in particular language training*

Under the umbrella of the ESF Federal Integration Directive (2014-2019, total volume 93.5 million euros federal and 105.7 million euros ESF funds), projects and measures to improve the chances of integration of young people with special needs are carried out to enable them
to obtain a degree or an education. Implementation takes place in joint projects involving companies, job centers, and employment agencies. The 128 joint projects with around 500 subprojects are divided into three main areas of action, of which the main focus of the present analysis is the integration of asylum seekers and refugees (IvAF). The program is aimed at asylum seekers, tolerated persons and refugees with at least subordinate access to the labor market. Currently, 41 networks with about 300 sub-projects offer measures of target-group-specific individual counseling, activation in cooperation with companies, qualification and placement in VET and employment (see BMAS 2017, p.4, BMBF 2017a, pp. 97-98).

Occupational language training is the subject of the ESF program for the occupational language training of people with a migrant background (2015-2017), which is aimed at persons entitled to receive benefits under SGB II and SGB III. The program is implemented by the Federal Office for Migration and Refugees (BAMF) and expires at the end of 2017. It will gradually be replaced by the occupational German language training according to § 45a AufenthG, which has been in place since July 2016 as a standard benefit. This also is implemented by the course offers of the BAMF (see BMBF 2017, pp. 98-99).

Transitions into vocational training

There are two central funding programs in Germany that are relevant for migrants in the section promotion of the transition into vocational training - this generic term can be used to summarize vocational orientation and vocational preparation. These are the federal program "Occupational Orientation for Refugees" (BOF Berufsorientierung für Flüchtlinge) and the “STRENGTHEN THE YOUTH” (JUGEND STÄRKEN) initiative, which is financed by federal as well as ESF funds. In addition, there is a cross-departmental support program, the federal and state initiative "Graduation and Connection - education chains until completion of training" (Abschluss und Anschluss - Bildungsketten bis zum Ausbildungsabschluss), which includes preparation for and entry into vocational training as well as support during training up to the completion of a vocational qualification.

The "Occupational Orientation for Refugees" program is co-funded by the Federal Ministry of Education and Research, the Federal Employment Agency and the Central Confederation of German Crafts and runs from 2016 to 2018. The funding volume of the program amounts to 40 million euros. The objective of the program is to prepare young refugees for vocational training by bringing them in direct contact with companies; the target group consists of young people entitled to political asylum, asylum-seekers, recognized refugees as well as tolerated persons (Geduldete) with access to the labor market. As part of the program, the Federal Employment Agency promotes measures to introduce adolescents to the training places market in accordance with § 45 SGB III, while the BMBF promotes projects for in-depth vocational orientation that follow up the Federal Employment Agency’s offers (see BMBF 2017a, p. 84). Currently, as of May 2017, there are 73 such projects, which are supported by craft chambers, municipal craft associations or craft training centers. The in-depth vocational orientation, which also includes subject-specific language training, consists of a nine-
week practical phase in training workshops of inter-company vocational training centers in the craft trades and a subsequent four-week practice phase in a training company. The goal is to integrate up to 10,000 young people from the aforementioned target groups into vocational training (see BMBF 2017b).

The funding initiative “STRENGTHEN THE YOUTH” is jointly managed by the Federal Ministry for Family Affairs, Senior Citizens, Women and Youth (BMFSFJ Bundesministerium für Familie, Senioren, Frauen und Jugend) and the Federal Ministry for the Environment, Nature Conservation, Building and Nuclear Safety (BMUB Bundesministerium für Umwelt, Naturschutz, Bau und Reaktorsicherheit) and has a funding volume of 52 million euros a year from federal funds and 25.5 million euros from the ESF. The different program lines are aimed at disadvantaged young people with or without a migrant background, whose entry into VET is to be supported by counseling services. Relevant for the target group of the present study is the program “Youth Migration Services” (JMD Jugendmigrationsdienste), which is aimed at people with a migration background between the ages of 12 and 27 and supports them in their transition from school into an occupation through social-educational counseling and support. There currently are around 450 facilities of this kind, which support around 100,000 young people every year. The “STRENGHTEN THE YOUTH in the Neighborhood” (JUGEND STÄRKEN im Quartier) and “STRENGHTEN THE YOUTH: 1000 Opportunities” (JUGEND STÄRKEN: 1000 Chancen) programs, also under the umbrella of the above-mentioned initiative, aimed at providing disadvantaged young people access to vocational training, are not specifically addressed to but open to refugees or persons with a migrant background (see BMBF 2017a, p. 85).

**VET assistance**

There are two support programs for refugees and migrants in the section of assisting existing training relationships and the optimization of VET structures. While the BMBF program “JOBSTARTER / JOBSTARTER plus” covers different emphases and sets changing priorities in the various funding rounds, the program "Welcome Guides" is specifically aimed at supporting training companies in the integration of refugees.

The “JOBSTARTER / JOBSTARTER plus” program is the responsibility of the BMBF and supports projects aimed at improving regional VET structures and testing innovative VET concepts. The total volume in the “JOBSTARTER plus” program is 109 million euros for the period 2015-2019; the “JOBSTARTER” program had a volume of 8 million euros in the 6th funding round 2013-2016. The activity of this funding program that is relevant for the target group of the present analysis is the Coordination Center Training and Migration (KAUSA Koordinierungsstelle Ausbildung und Migration), which supports companies, young people with a migrant background including refugees and their parents in matters relating to their entry into in-company training through a total of 29 service centers (see BMBF 2017a, pp. 86-87).
The “Welcome Guides” are an offer for small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) to help them secure skilled personnel by training refugees. The program runs from 2016 to 2018 and is supported by the Federal Ministry of Economic Affairs and Energy (BMWi Bundesministerium für Wirtschaft und Energie). The funding volume in 2016 was 7.1 million euros. The role of the “Welcome Guides” is to inform SMEs about the potential of training refugees, the corresponding national and regional funding opportunities, and to advise and support companies on all practical training issues. If necessary, they also advise in matters of welcome culture within the company. The welcome guides, whose number amounts to about 150, work for chambers and other economic institutions (see BMBF 2017a, p. 88).

3.2 Israel

3.2.1 Vocational education and training system

Non-tertiary vocational training in Israel is, in principle, a juxtaposition of two systems, which are supervised and operated by different ministries (see ETF 2014b, ETF 2017). While the Ministry of Education is responsible for traditional school-based vocational training, the Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs and Services is implementing a system of vocational training for job-seekers and disadvantaged people. Certain areas of vocational education and training, such as postsecondary vocational training in the form of “practical engineering” and “technician” programs (see below) are also offered side by side in the areas of competence of the two ministries. This fragmentation combined with the emergence of parallel structures is a major obstacle to the effectiveness of vocational training in Israel (see Musset et al., 2014, p. 48). In order to improve the coordination of the system as a whole, a vocational training committee with the participation of both ministries was set up in 2014, but its specific powers remain undetermined (see ETF 2017, pp. 7-8).

The school-based vocational training, which is supervised by the Ministry of Education, is part of upper secondary education, which is divided in its entirety in accordance with the multi-ethnic and multi-religious population structure of Israel in various branches. There are over 1400 Jewish secondary schools, of which 660 are state schools, over 300 state religious schools, and over 550 schools of the ultra-orthodox Jewish population group (Haredim). There are around 250 Arabic schools, just below 50 schools for Bedouins, and 27 schools for Druze populations. Approximately 150,000 students (about 40% of an age cohort) receive vocational training courses. Of these, around 137,000 are for training courses within the responsibility of the Ministry of Education, while the remaining 13,000 are allocated to the Ministry of Labor (see ETF 2014b, p. 9). In contrast to Germany, vocational education and training therefore plays a role that is inferior to general and academic education, although the percentage of pupils who completed vocational training courses within upper secondary education increased from 38.5% to 40.8% between 2011 and 2015 (See ETF 2017, p. 14).

---

2 The current state: Since there have been a number of changes in the departmental division in recent years, some other terms are sometimes used in the cited sources.
Vocational and vocational training courses within the Ministry of Education are not offered at independent vocational schools, but at secondary schools in parallel with general education courses, and serve not only the provision of professional knowledge but also the qualification for a university degree. The integration of these courses into the general education system was undertaken with a view to counteracting the stigmatization of vocational training, but it has not been able to prevent vocational education and training in Israel from being generally regarded as a second-rate option (see ETF 2014a, p -10).

Vocational or occupational courses in upper secondary education, under the responsibility of the Ministry of Education, are divided into a technological-scientific education and a vocational (occupational) education. The first branch includes engineering studies to prepare for university studies and, on the other hand, a technical area for the qualification of post-secondary vocational education and training (see below). The occupational branch, which is more strictly professional, leads to qualifications, which qualify for the labor market (see ETF 2017, p. 7).

The offers of vocational training in the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Labor include so-called “apprenticeship” programs, furthermore vocational preparation, and vocational training for young people with special needs, as well post-secondary programs in the technical sector - a shared responsibility with the Ministry of Education. The courses are carried out at vocational schools, professional colleges, and training centers for adults (see ETF 2017, p. 7).

The "apprenticeship" trades combine vocational training with operational practice, but unlike in the dual system in Germany, the school is the primary responsible actor for education and the dominant place of learning, so that it is rather in the sense of the classification given in section 1 a school education with a strong practice component and not an apprenticeship in the strict sense. The relevant training courses are divided into 14 professional fields with a total of around 80 specializations. With the successful completion of the training, a professional certificate is issued. The full-time vocational training courses at the upper secondary level - as well as the general programs - lead to Bagrut, the entrance exam for the university, i.e. the professional learning paths also provide direct access to the university. In the "apprenticeship" programs this test is, however, not taken, so that the connectivity of these programs is more restricted (see. Musset et al. 2014, p 14).

At the level of post-secondary vocational training, various forms of vocational training for young adults, most importantly the school-based VET in the areas of "practical engineering" and "technician," exist within the portfolio of Ministry of Education. The former amount to two years full-time or three years part-time (2200 hours), and the latter include 1600 hours (one year full-time / two years part-time). These programs, offered at vocational colleges (technical colleges), are at the interface between vocational and academic education and correspond to concepts such as the so-called "short-cycle higher education," represented for example by the Dutch associate degree, or secondary special education as a state certified technician in Germany (see. Musset et al. 2014, pp 16-17).
Vocational programs for adults in the area of the Ministry of Labor are aimed at integration or reintegration into the labor market. They are directed typically towards job seekers aged 28 to 35 years. The courses are offered in various professional fields (e.g. electricians, carpenters, mechanics, etc.). The programs are carried out over a period of less than one year full-time; thus, they rather are in the nature of skills training for individuals with work experience than a fundamental VET. In addition to these programs for job seekers, programs for disadvantaged, among those Arab Israelis and Haredim, are offered (see. Musset et al. 2014, pp. 17-18).

The responsibility for labor market policies including integration through qualification is assigned to the Ministry of Economy. Other actors are the umbrella organization of the social partners (Histadrut), the National Insurance Institute of Israel, which is responsible for the implementation of unemployment insurance, and the Treasury. For specific target groups, such as the Arab population, there are additional responsibilities on the part of the Authority for the Economic Development of the Arab Sector (AEDA), the welfare, as well as the immigration department (see. ETF 2017, p 11).

Vocational guidance and job placement are carried out by the Public Employment Service (PES) as a central labor market service providers. A new development in the field of counseling are the so-called Employment Orientation Centers, created in 2016 as one-stop shops for the Arab population. Skills training for jobseekers are conducted by the Manpower Training and Development Bureau (MTDB) within the Ministry of Labor. The MTDB annually conducts about 500 courses with around 7500 participants. Vouchers are also issued to about 1,500 beneficiaries per year for training at recognized public and private educational institutions. The allocations to the measures of MTDB are done by the PES or the Employment Orientation Centers (see.ETF 2017, p 12).

3.2.2 Immigration situation – historical, legal, current

Immigration: Unlike Germany, Israel has had the character of an immigration country from the beginning of its state’s existence, but with the particularity that immigration has always been a privilege of people of the Jewish faith. The State of Israel has made it its primary task to provide them a home. The absorption of people with different ethnic or religious background is provided only in exceptional cases. For example, 800.000 Jewish refugees from Arab countries have come to Israel, in the context of the Arab-Israeli conflict after the founding in 1948, until the end of the 1950s. A second major wave of immigration was the influx of about 160.000 immigrants from the former Soviet Union in the 1970s. In a second wave in 1989 also more than 1 million immigrants from the Soviet Union or its successor states came into the country. Finally, in the 1980s and 1990s, about 100,000 Jewish immigrants from Ethiopia were taken in.

The immigration of people from different countries to Israel persists on a quantitatively low level, while the politically accepted mass immigration of Jews (Aliyah) has come to an end to
a certain degree. In 2015, a total of 30,000 immigrants came to Israel, of which almost a third came from Western European countries.

In today’s Israeli society, the dichotomy within the Jewish population of Jews of European and American descent (Ashkenazi) and Jews of Middle Eastern origin (Mizrahi) continues to exist, which is also reflected in patterns of economic activity and in related educational preferences. While Ashkenazim tended to academic education, vocational training has traditionally been the domain of the economically worse off Mizrahim, which at times are a major target group for this educational path that should improve their social integration. Today, the groups do not differ in their distribution on education and training programs in a significant way (see ETF 2014a, p 7).

The immigrants from the Russian-speaking countries and Ethiopia present a challenge for the current education and labor market policy. In the case of the Ethiopian immigrants around three-quarters of them have not experienced any significant education in the country of origin and are, therefore, not literate in their native language. The formal education level of Russian-speaking immigrants, however, is very high, but this group of immigrants experiences difficulties in adapting to language and customs of the new environment (see FIG. ETF 2014a, p. 7). The Israelis of Ethiopian origin continue to be a "problem group" in the labor market integration, whereas the labor force participation of the Haredim, which also experience by access problems, increased in 2008-2013 from 33.5% to 44.5% for men, and from 55% to 70% for women (see ETF 2017, pp. 6-7).

Other ways of immigration play a minor role in Israel; this is especially true for the forced migration. According to official statistics of the population, Immigration and Border Authority (PIBA) for the third quarter of 2016, about 40,700 asylum seekers were in Israel at that time, which represented less than 20% of long-term residents from foreign countries. The acceptance rate is below 1%, well below the international average, but people from these countries of origin - Sudan and Eritrea – are generally protected from deportation. Although required by law, even tolerated asylum seekers usually do not get a work permit, so that group is explicitly excluded from labor market integration (see Aid Organization for Refugees and Asylum Seekers in Israel 2016).

A common immigration law does not exist. A regulated immigration process is exclusively available for individuals who fall under the so-called Law of Return of 1950, according to which Jews from all countries possess the right of establishment in Israel (see FIG. DC Law Offices 2014b). As part of the immigration process, which opens up the path to the determination of their settlement permit and to citizenship, entitled persons covered by this law are already allowed to start work. Foreign nationals, who are not covered by the Law of Return, have to maintain a temporary visa for employment (B / 1 Work Visa) (see DC Law Offices 2014a.) In certain circumstances, prerequisite is usually that a specific workplace is detected or the application is approved by an Israeli employer. Work permits of these prescriptions are issued in the following categories:
- Nurses (maximum 5 years)
- Expert / Manager (maximum 5 years)
- Executives with airlines and transport companies (maximum 2 years)
- Research and teaching staff at universities
- Medical staff
- Artist
- Short term applied activities (maximum 3 months).

3.2.3 Program lines for promoting integration measures

The programs and initiatives aimed at the occupational integration of structurally disadvantaged groups into the Israeli labor market are for the most part described in chapter 4, as a strict separation of program lines and measures is not always possible given their scale. There are also broader programs in the section of active labor market policy which are similar to the above-mentioned program lines in terms of their importance for disadvantaged groups, but, unlike those described for Germany, do not explicitly refer to migrants or refugees.

As noted in chapter..., Arab Israelis and the ultra-Orthodox population are the target groups facing particular challenges in the labor market (see, for example, ETF 2017, p. 9). While the participation rate of the ultra-Orthodox increases, the economic integration of the Arab population stagnates. Its contribution to the gross domestic product amounts to only 8% with a population share of about 20%. Persistent barriers to development include an unequal distribution of resources, a lack of development of professional skills within the Arab population, and cultural barriers between Arab-Israeli and Jewish-Israeli citizens (ETF 2017, p. 9).

Against this background, in 2010, the Israeli government formulated the employment policy objective of creating 700,000 new jobs by 2020, of which 300,000 are to be created in the Arab-Israeli sector and 180,000 in the ultra-Orthodox population group. Achieving this objective would require the creation of 175,000 additional jobs beyond the achievable economic growth (see OECD 2015, p. 21). Active labor market programs include a “Welfare to Work” program, “Earned Income Tax Credit” for employees, and the “Employment Orientation Centers” for the Arab population described earlier. The "Welfare to Work” program, which ran from 2005 to 2010, created employment opportunities for up to 46,000 recipients of unemployment benefits to help them transition into regular employment. Of the approximately 29,000 people who actually took part in such an employment measure, 13,000 entered an employment relationship with earnings above the minimum wage (see OECD 2015, p. 23). Due to the increasingly negative attitude of the Israeli public, the program was discontinued in 2010 (see ETF 2015, p. 12).
The “Earned Income Tax Credit,” which has existed since 2008, is a program that provides low-income workers with a wage subsidy. According to National Insurance Institute surveys, the program has resulted in poverty reduction and has proven to be a tool to strengthen the labor market participation of the disadvantaged (ETF 2015, p.12, OECD 2015, p.23).

The activities of the Authority for the Economic Development of the Arab Sector (AEDA) play a central role in the economic development of the Arab-Israeli population. The task of this department is to implement existing instruments of labor market policy in a culture-sensitive and target group-specific manner within the Arab population. The AEDA awards training vouchers for Vocational Training Programs supported by the Ministry of Labor, arranges wage subsidies for employers in the Arab sector, and offers employment and job placement services (see OECD 2015, p. 24).

4. Comparative analysis: policy areas and measures

The following sections of integration measures are described for both countries:

- Vocational orientation and vocational preparation
- Vocational education and training
- Qualification and further training
- Job placement, counseling, and assistance

4.1 Germany

4.1.1 Vocational orientation and preparation

Measures of vocational orientation and preparation that is directed towards refugees, asylum seekers, and displaced people, or that are suitable for them, are found at the interface of active labor market policy and VET policy. The main focus of vocational orientation and preparation is on persons who are not yet eligible for direct vocational training – which may include persons with an immigration background in the third and fourth generation – part of the employment promotion of the Federal Agency of Employment according to the social legislation SGB (Sozialgesetzbuch) III. In addition, however, the provisions of the Vocational Training Act (§§ 68-70 BBiG) also apply to the vocational preparation for people with learning disabilities or socially disadvantaged persons. On the threshold between the general education system, a differentiated system of vocational training measures ("transitional system") has been developed, which in the year 2016 has absorbed roundabout 300,000 young people. This system includes, among other things, the school-based vocational training year (Berufsvorbereitungsjahr BVJ) – with 100,000 new entrants to the quantitatively most important area - as well as the basic vocational training year and the entry qualification (Einstiegsqualifizierung EQ) and other pre-employment measures of the Federal Employment

---

3 The school school-based vocational training preparation (“Berufsvorbereitungsjahr”) is under the responsibility of the federal states and will not be covered here.
Entry qualification (EQ) is a measure for the acquisition of first professional capacities within a company in order to transition into VET. The instrument, which is aimed at young people with placement obstacles, has been supplemented by the possibility of participation in language courses for people with a experience of displacement.

Since refugees have the same access to the labor market as residents, and for asylum seekers as well as tolerated persons (“Geduldete”) access was improved, the measures in question are open to these groups of people. This also applies to the instruments to be discussed in the following sections (see OECD 2017, pp. 26-27).

A measure specific to the target group of the present study is the so-called integration courses organized by the Federal Office for Migration and Refugees (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge BAMF), which primarily serve the language acquisition and are indispensable for participation in the labor market. The courses, organized by the BAMF, consist of a language course with 600 hours of instruction and an orientation course of 100 lessons. In the latter, basic knowledge about life in Germany is taught. The language course aims to enable participants to master the German language at level B1 of the Common European Framework of Reference. Whereas, integration courses were originally only available for accepted refugees, asylum seekers with a perspective to stay and tolerated persons have access to the courses since November 2015 (cf. OECD 2017, pp. 39-40). At the end of the integration course, a language test can be taken, and in case of failing the test, 300 additional hours of language teaching are granted. According to the experience gained so far, the acquisition of the language through the integration courses is not very effective, as only half of the participants take the test, and only around 60% of them reach the desired level of language (see Bertelsmann Stiftung 2017, p. 13).

The vocational orientation of young refugees and asylum seekers takes place initially within the framework of the regular activities of the Federal Agency for Employment (see Bertelsmann Stiftung 2017, p. 25). In addition, there is an initiative specifically directed at this group, the most important being the vocational orientation for refugees (BOF) of the Federal Ministry of Education and Research (Bundesministerium für Bildung und Forschung BMBF) and the "Perspectives for Young Refugees" program (PerjuF), also launched by the BMBF in cooperation with the Central Association of German Handicrafts (see synopsis Germany).

4.1.2 Vocational training

VET in a recognized occupation is open to asylum seekers and refugees, as they already have almost the same access to the labor market as other people in Germany. While asylum seekers can take up training after three months of their ongoing asylum procedure, access without a waiting period is granted to tolerated persons as well as refugees with a residence permit. This formal equality also means that specific training courses are not intended for the relevant target group in the dual system or other areas of the German vocational training
Refugees and comparable immigrant groups are allowed to apply for regular training places (see Söhn et al., 2017, pp. 29-30).

Actual access to training is, however, particularly problematic for refugees - as this is also the case for other people with an immigration background. People with a migration background are generally underrepresented in the dual vocational training. In 2015, 26% of young people without German citizenship received vocational training, whereas the proportion of German citizenship of the same age group was 56%. As training places are allocated through a corresponding market and, thus, in a competitive process, and the average educational level of persons with an immigration background is lower than that of nationals, young people without German nationality face a competitive disadvantage. Furthermore, it is assumed that operational decisions concerning the allocation of training places are partly influenced by reservations against non-German applicants (see BMBF 2017, p. 48-50). This problem also arises for young refugees, although the data situation in this area is uncertain, since the characteristic "flight context" ("Fluchtkontext") has only been recorded in the Federal Agency of Employment’s training statistics since 2016, but was not previously taken into account in the relevant educational statistics. The present findings suggest that the opportunities for entry into vocational training for so-called "applicants with a flight context" are less favorable than for any other target group (see BMBF 2017, p. 52). In addition to unfavorable educational prerequisites, this is again attributed to reservations on the employer’s side, according to which the fit and education level, especially of African young people, is considered insufficient (see Söhn et al., 2017, p. 30).

Another factor, which is detrimental to the introduction of regular vocational training, is the lack of security of the resident status in the medium-term perspective, since the issued residence permits allow for employment or training, but are limited in time or more specifically require periodic renewal. In the meantime, the problem has been taken into account by the introduction of a so-called "3 plus 2 rule," according to which asylum seekers and those who are tolerated have a residence permit for the regular training period of three years plus a subsequent two-year career start. However, the regulation is partly restricted by the local authorities responsible for foreigners and is not equally valid for all persons with "flight context." Its effectiveness is therefore limited (see OECD 2017, p. 9 and pp. 47-48). As a result, it can be said that regular vocational training alone is not fit to guarantee the labor market integration of the people migrating in the course of the so-called refugee crisis.

4.1.3 Qualification and vocational further education

In Germany, there is a comprehensive system of continuing vocational training, which, in addition to continuing vocational training according to the BBiG that serves the purpose of obtaining a higher professional qualification, also includes measures for further training and qualification for the purpose of adapting to changing requirements on the labor market, and, generally, serves to optimize the employability. These measures are funded by the Federal Agency for Employment (BA) under social legislation SGB III. Within the frame of this anal-
ysis it would go to far to describe adapting training measures for unemployed, migrants and other groups in more details.

Only few specific measures could be identified in this sector for the immigrant population with "flight context." The IQ “Bridge-measure“for academics with universitiyx degrees belongs to the area of adaptation training. The training consists technical sessions and integration elements as application training and counselling and company placement (see Synopsis DE)

4.1.4 Placement, counseling, and assistanc

Within the framework of labor market policy, Germany has a comprehensive and at the same time highly differentiated system of instruments, measures, and programs aimed at improving the transition into VET and employment, to which refugees generally have the same access as other labor market participants. In addition to permanent measures, which are mainly part of the standard offer of labor market policy instruments under SGB III, there are temporary programs specifically tailored to specific target groups, including refugees. Permanent benefits and measures (see BMBF 2017, p. 130 ff.) include:

- VET placement within the frame of employment promotion (SGB III) and the basic financial support for jobseekers (SGB II).

- Vocational training aid (Berufsausbildungsbeihilfe BAB): This is a financial contribution to the support of apprentices. The benefit is also for fugitives, who are in a VET.

- Assisted Training (Assistierte Ausbildung AsA): This tool is designed to assist the disadvantaged and their training companies. The accompaniment of the trainees is similar to that of training-accompanying aids (see below) and is adapted to the individual requirements of the training. Asylum seekers with a perspective to stay have access to the service after three months, tolerated persons after 12 months.

- Training-accompanying aids (abH): Trainees can be encouraged in the event of need by means of a social-pedagogical accompaniment during the training. Refugees have access to the measure after the above-mentioned waiting times.

Special measures for refugees and other immigrants include counseling and placement:

- The service center KAUSA and KAUSA Refugees target small and medium-sized enterprises. They sensitize, accompany, and support companies in the recruitment of young people with a migration background and refugees.

- The Federal Ministry of Economics and Technology (BMWi)-sponsored “welcome guides” (“Willkommenslotsen”) are assigned to the chambers. Branch-specific and local enterprises as well as refugees are advised and accompanied to ensure that they can be placed in the aforementioned measures.
The Initiative "Integration through Qualification" (IQ), which serves the implementation of the Recognition Act, on the basis of which foreign professional qualifications can be recognized in Germany. In addition to advising applicants, the initiative also offers bridging offers for the qualification of persons whose professional qualifications have not been fully recognized (see Synopsis DE).

**Conclusion on the situation in Germany:**

The focus of the labor market integration of immigrants, in particular those with a flight background, is not in the field of vocational education and training in Germany, but rather in vocational preparation in the so-called transitional system as well as in the various labor market policy measures to support the transition to training and accompaniment. Vocational education in the narrow sense is not intended as a tool for the social integration of the disadvantaged in Germany, but as a qualification path for the majority of the population, i.e. it does not constitute a social net in itself. With regard to the labor market integration of immigrants and people with a flight background, the task is to ensure the transition into the VET system for this group of people.

The focus on approaches that are primarily concerned with the integration of disadvantaged people and less with the entry of qualified persons into employment is explained by the specific disadvantages of refugees, which do not have a formal qualification that corresponds to the German employment system – a system comparable to the one in Germany does not exist in the respective countries of origin or only in a rudimentary form – and cannot establish themselves on the VET market immediately. To this extent, the immigrants outlined in chapter 1 are to be considered disadvantaged persons with regard to the German labor market, to which the existing instruments of vocational education and labor market policy measures can be applied. These measures can benefit both refugees and third-generation or fourth-generation migrants facing structurally similar problems. At the heart of these considerations are, however, refugees, because their integration is the main challenge for the German education and employment system due to the quantitative dimension of the immigration.

4.2 Israel

4.2.1 Vocational orientation and preparation

In Israel, there are various offers for new immigrants as well as minority members, with which the mentioned groups of persons are to be facilitated or access to vocational training is made possible. The primary focus here is language learning. To learn the Hebrew language, the standardized course system "Ulpan," which is aimed at Jewish immigrants according to the Law of Return, is available. These are the only target group for which a system of language acquisition with state support is available.

The labor market integration of members of the ultra-Orthodox population group is a particular challenge to Israeli society due to the size of this group - which already accounts for 10% of the Israeli population in 2016 and is growing rapidly. As 56% of this population live below
the poverty line and half are younger than 14 years old, the question of integration into the employment system has far-reaching implications for society as a whole, which in case of success would benefit from a significant pool of skilled workers, while in the other case a significant burden of the welfare state. Enabling working conditions that are compatible with the religious needs of this population group is seen as an important incentive for gainful employment (see ETF 2017, p. 6). Vocational preparation for this group is provided through various initiatives. These are all co-operations of educational institutions and companies; Co-operations are usually funded by the Israeli government. The offers of KamaTech and Kivun Centers are aimed exclusively at men of the affected population, while the courses of the "Mercaz Chareidi Centers" are open to both men and women. The content of the educational offers directed at the ultra-Orthodox is highly differentiated and includes on the one hand acquiring key qualifications such as English or computer skills, but on the other also professional contents (see Synopsis IL). They are thus part of the qualification and continuing vocational training.

The Israeli Ethiopian group, whose integration, as stated, is also a particular challenge, is addressed by the Space program, co-sponsored by the Ministry of Immigration, the Ministry of Education, and the National Project for Ethiopian Immigrants. The program includes a social pedagogical accompaniment of school education for young people in classes 8-12. The aim is to strengthen their self-confidence, to increase the identification with Israeli society, and to contribute to an improvement in school performance. The program is, therefore, not specifically related to the professional world, but it is of great significance for labor market integration, as it relates to the general improvement of young people's readiness and ability for vocational training.

4.2.2 Vocational training

In regular upper secondary and post-secondary vocational education and training, there are no specific offers for immigrants or persons with special access barriers, according to the results of the literature research. The integration of disadvantaged people is instead supported by vocational training for special groups within the Ministry of Labor's jurisdiction (see point 3.2.3) and labor market policy instruments (see point 3.2.4).

4.2.3 Qualification and vocational further education

As stated in the second chapter, the Manpower Training and Development Bureau operates a system of professional qualification for adults within the Department of the Ministry of Labor. The target groups of this system are dismissed soldiers, the unemployed, immigrants – meaning those residents entitled by the Law of Return - as well as the unemployed university graduates who are classified in a separate category. This system mainly covers the professional fields of metal processing / mechanical engineering, care, catering and electrical engineering / electronics. The voucher system mentioned in the second chapter, which allows beneficiaries to receive a qualification measure from an educational institution of their
choice, primarily targets men from the ultra-Orthodox population group, women from the Arab population group and people with disabilities. Challenges for the state-sponsored qualification are the non-transparent access criteria and inadequate funding. As a result, only about 1% of the unemployed could take part in qualification measures in the past few years (See ETF 2017, 11).

4.2.4 Placement, counseling, and assistance

In the area of labor market policy measures for groups with specific barriers to market entry, the above-mentioned activities for the economic development of the Arab and the ultra-Orthodox (Haredi) population group are to be mentioned. For each of the two groups, a system of "Employment Orientation Centers" has been set up, which serve as a single point of contact for labor market services tailored to the specific cultural characteristics of each group (see ETF 2015, p. 9; ETF 2017, S. 12; p. 12; OECD 2016, p. 8).

Young people with special needs or those with a particular risk of an education drop out are the target group of publicly funded labor market services. Among these, the so-called Youth Centers and the Afikim Program are the most important. The youth centers run by the municipalities provide young people from 18 to 30 years of various counseling and support programs, including counseling in the area of professional choice, helping to prepare a written application, and preparing for job interviews. The Afikim program of the Ministry of Social Affairs and Social Services, in turn, aims to provide employment for people between 18 and 27 who are not in education or employment. For this purpose, the participants are guided throughout an 18-month internship, which entails individual coaching. In the course of the measure, the persons concerned are to be qualified for a permanent employment relationship (see ETF 2015, p. 13).

Afikim is a program that aims to help families escape from poverty by primarily supporting children and also parents ("parental empowerment centers") in a variety of ways. There are programs devoted to vocational preparation and acquiring skills required in the Israeli working world ("Vocational Training", "Computer Learning Centers"), as well as other out-of-school programs aimed at social inclusion ("Afternoon Youth Centers", "Enrichment Programs", "Values for the Future", "Afikim B'Kef Day Camps" day trips during the summer holidays). The target group orientation becomes apparent considering the included food programs for the children who visit the centers ("Food for Thought") and food stamps for families ("food cards"). All programs have a social-pedagogical character, in particular the "Academic Program," a tutoring program which also seeks contact with the teachers of the participants.

In addition to the above-mentioned programs, specific measures targeting women were identified. The "Eshet Chayil - Women's Empowerment in Employment" program was originally aimed only at women from the Ethiopian immigrant group. The content of the program has been and is the provision of basic skills relevant to the labor market and support
for job placement. The program was subsequently extended to include women from other immigrant groups - mainly from the successor states of the former Soviet Union - and under the designation "Rihadiya" to the Arab-Israeli population group (see synopsis Israel).

**Conclusion of the situation in Israel:**
Immigration to Israel is mainly made up of Jewish people (Olim), who make Israel their home in the Law of Return (Aliyah). On the other hand, immigration of people of other origins is not generally intended, although the granting of temporary residence permits to take up employment is possible. Against this background, there are no specific measures on the labor market integration of immigrants, as far as they are not Jewish immigrants. As a rule, refugees have no access to existing programs for the integration of the disadvantaged, although they have the opportunity to work.

In principle, the approach to focusing on measures for the integration of culturally disadvantaged people also offers a significant potential for comparison in the case of Israel. As a result of the ethnic and religious diversity of Israeli society, which is also reflected in a corresponding differentiation of the school system, there also is the problem of the integration of groups of persons whose educational background is not compatible with the requirements of the labor market. Thus, members of the Arab-Israeli population group are under-average in the labor market and are prevented from adequate participation in the labor market by means of language and cultural barriers. Haredi cultural peculiarities also exacerbate their participation in working life and require adaptation on both sides.

**Conclusion of the focus on disadvantaged persons**
- The concept of immigrants allows for different definitions in Germany and Israel.
- In a German-Israeli comparison of labor market integration, certain target groups are of interest, some of which are not included in the definition of "immigrants" in Israel. The are, in particular, Israeli Arabs and ultra-orthodox Jews, who differ culturally (muslims, or ultra-orthodox Jews with strict gender segregation) and also linguistically (ultra-orthodox Jews often do not speak English – a major disadvantage in highly-developed Israeli labor market) from the perceived majority society.
- The refugees who came to Germany in particular in the years 2015 and 2016 are mostly from the Arabic linguistic and cultural area and therefore also show a linguistic and cultural difference to Germany’s perceived majority.

The under-qualification of many Ethiopian Jews for the Israeli labor market as well as some other groups from the various groups of the Olim who speak neither Hebrew nor English are also suitable for comparison because of their similar conditions.

**4.3 Conclusion of the selection of seminar topics**
Based on the analysis, comparative and overarching topics were proposed for the planned seminar.
4.3.1 Comparative topics

**Topic: Language integration of immigrants in Germany and Israel**
In the case of newly immigrated people, mainly refugees in Germany, great emphasis is placed on language acquisition and language practice, since this is the cornerstone of labor market integration. A combination of language and labor market-relevant education was recognized and used as an effective tool. Therefore, these instruments are used for professional purposes. Examples are the integration courses as well as the supplementation of the entrance qualifications (EQ) by means of language support courses (see 3.1.1 and 3.1.4).

For the social integration in Israel the acquisition of the Hebrew language is a basic prerequisite. Many Olim and minorities in Israel are not fluent in Hebrew and, thus, are given the opportunity to learn the language. For the Olim group, the "Ulpan" system is the appropriate starting point, while the language support for the Israeli Arabs is linked to the qualification measures for these population groups. Depending on the language level, the technical language is part of the Ulpan courses.

**Topic: Vocational orientation in Germany and Israel**
For occupational orientation, BOF (occupational orientation for refugees) in Germany is a good example of the integration of refugees into the labor market, which builds on several levels. The initiative "Pathways to Training for Refugees" provides a three-step approach in which the integration course are the starting point, followed by a PerF (Perspective for refugees) measure, and finally the targeted vocational orientation can be carried out with BOF.

In Israel there are different approaches tailored to the needs of the target groups, which are pursued in a community center or school. The respective background and the prerequisites of the target groups are used as a starting point for vocational orientation. It focuses on cultural needs, such as offering a course for ultra-Orthodox women. It focuses on cultural needs, such as offering a course for ultra-Orthodox men.

**Topic: Vocational preparation in Germany and Israel**
A large proportion of the measures and projects used in the labor market integration of migrants in Germany were categorized as vocational preparation. While direct access to vocational training is possible, it is made more difficult in practice because of the inadequate preparation and qualifications of the applicants from the point of view of the companies. For the German context, vocational preparation in the so-called transitional system is the main field of action in the labor market integration of young migrants (see 3.1.1). This should give high priority to the issue of vocational preparation in the seminar.

In the vocational preparation of the Israeli measures, the cultural characteristics of the target groups are not neglected. In addition to the equipment with tools necessary for the work place, cultural aspects, such as family conflict resolution when starting to work, are included. There is a high level of accommodation to the given conditions of the target group, such as the integration of religious practice and child care. This reflects the structure of Israeli society
of various ethnic-religious groups, which, to a certain extent, is evident in the separate institutional structures in education as well as in labor market policy.

**Topic: Counseling / assistance of participants and / or companies in Germany and Israel**

During employment or training, measures, and projects are also being implemented in Germany for guidance and / or counseling. Particularly noteworthy here are the “assistance that is provided during VET” (Ausbildungsbegleitende Hilfen AbH), in which a social pedagogical and learning support takes place, and the “assisted training” (Assistierte Ausbildung AsA), in which, in addition to the linguistic support of the trainees, the company is helped in education-relevant topics. In addition, there are also federal state initiatives, such as the KAUSA Servicestelle, which focus on advice and support.

The KAUSA service center offers a high comparative potential with its structure being similar to Israeli measures, such as the Employment Centers, with its offers ranging from professional orientation to VET accompaniment.

For a sustainable employment in Israel, participants are accompanied by measures during job interviews and supported after working hours. This support takes place both individually and in groups, where employees can exchange experiences and find mutual support. The reason for this approach is that these communities were previously excluded from the labor market and they are now experiencing resistance to their new work-centered life. The Israeli “Centers for Young Adults” are an example for this approach. For young adults between the ages of 18-35, a wide range of services is provided, including education, employment, family life, financial planning, as well as life planning.

**4.3.2 Cross-cutting topics**

Cross-cutting topics that could be addressed in the seminar are located at the level of the structures and strategies, which is different from the operational level, and are worth exchanging. Three topics are offered as options.

**Topic: Introduction - Vocational integration of immigrants in both countries**

An introduction to the vocational integration of immigrants should focus on the current situation of vocational integration in both countries, so that the background is not provided solely on the basis of the preparatory materials. It creates a common basis and approach.

**Topic: Recognition of qualifications**

An interesting topic of the exchange is the recognition of qualifications – both countries have developed procedures for this.

In Israel, there are three procedures for assessing equivalence with Israeli degrees for foreign academic qualifications, which differ in their organization and their legal effects. The procedures are independent of one another, i.e. an equivalence determination for one area has no
effect on any of the other areas and does not absolve the need to re-examine the conclusion elsewhere on its equivalence.

A distinction must be drawn between the following types of recognition: (1) recognition for study purposes, (2) permission to pursue professional activities, (3) recognition for the purpose of salary in the public sector (see Ministry of Aliyah and Integration). Recognition for study purposes is undertaken by the university – it is to be determined if a foreign academic degree meets the requirements for a graduate study at an Israeli university. A centralized procedure does not exist. The second case concerns members of regulated professions, who wish to pursue their profession in Israel. These require a permit for professional practice, which must be applied for at the relevant ministry responsible for the relevant professional group. The third method is the determination of equivalence for the purposes of the salary scale implemented by the Ministry of Education (see Ministry of Education, 2015a, 2015b): Academic degrees are determined by the Department for Evaluation of Foreign Academic Degrees according to formal criteria, such as the scope in points of performance or semester weeks. In the case of bachelor’s degrees, missing study periods of up to one semester can be replaced by professional experience – this is not possible at the higher qualification levels.

The German system of recognition of professional qualifications differentiates from the Israeli system, because the Israeli system focuses exclusively on academic degrees, and it does not take into account the qualifications of non-tertiary vocational training and also does not make a generally binding statement on the equivalence of professional qualification, which would be equally applicable to the education system and the labor market.

Topic: Vocational training and methodology / didactics of cultural differences / inclusion in the professional integration of immigrants in both countries

The topics "dealing with target group-specific didactics / methodology for integration / inclusion and linguistic and cultural needs" as well as the resulting challenges for education and counseling personnel – and their qualification and professionalization – did not emerge from the literature. Knowledge growth could be gained in the treatment of these topics in the seminar.

On the German side, the debate about inclusion is up-to-date and controversial. In vocational education and training, a broad understanding of inclusion, which includes the disadvantaged, is opposed to a limited understanding that only includes people with disabilities.

In the Israeli tradition, as it views itself as an immigration country, there are other experiences in dealing with diversity. It is interesting to deal with differences and the question of inclusion or separation or didactics in homogeneous or heterogeneous groups. Maybe both approaches are needed – a question that promises interesting insights for an exchange in the seminar.
5. Success stories and success factors in Germany and Israel

Course of the seminar

The three-day seminar in Tel Aviv in October 2017 dealt with the concepts of measures and good practice projects of both countries on the topics of language acquisition and vocational preparation as well as counseling / assistance. Experts from the programmatic and operational level of both countries discussed success factors, program structures, and transfer possibilities (see seminar program).

On October 23, the seminar was opened by Susanne Burger from the German Federal Ministry of Education and Research on the German side and Shooly Eyal, head of the Manpower Training & Development Bureau MTDB (Vocational Training Office), on the Israeli side. The first day of the seminar was used to provide a knowledge base with lectures on labor market integration in both countries.

Furthermore, on this day the topic of language acquisition in both countries was dealt with and discussed on a programmatic and operational level with a total of four lectures. Iris Beckmann-Schulz from the IQ specialist office for occupational German presented the language course formats in Germany, and Judith Hochstein presented the methodology and didactics of the language courses offered by GFBM gGmbH. On the Israeli side, Avri Polacheck, educational director of the MTDB (Vocational Training Bureau), introduced Hebrew immersion programs for various target groups, and Yelena Pergament, for the Jewish Agency, introduced the process of integration of Jewish immigrants. At the end of the seminar day, the subject of vocational preparation in Germany was presented, whereby Ulrich Eberle from the Federal Employment Agency presented the programmatic and Anja Heinicke from the Chamber of Trade Potsdam commented on the operational level of the “perspective for young refugees” project (Perspektive für junge Flüchtlinge PerjuF) project that she leads.

The second day of the seminar, on October 24, local projects were visited and questions could be exchanged directly with the Israeli practitioners. The Riyan Center of the Al-Fanar Program in the Arab Israeli town of Tira was presented by program manager Ella Eyal Bar-David as well as center managers Samah Heib-Jaljouli and Nibras Taha, who stem from the Arab-Israeli community. There are currently 21 such employment centers throughout Israel, offering pre-vocational training courses for Arab Israelis, particularly women.

Even the lunch break was used effectively to gain impressions of Israeli projects. In the successful project of the Culinary School in Tira, confectioners and cooks are trained, who had to prove their craft for the seminar participants.

In the afternoon, the Absorption Center Beit Brodetsky in Tel Aviv was visited. Here, Jewish immigrants can stay for the first 6 months after their arrival, learn Hebrew and get help for settling in. After the group was given an impression by Anat Carmel-Kagan and her col-
league about the first time in Israel for the Jewish immigrants (Olim) after the Aliyah - the return of the Jewish people to Israel - three Olim presented their own personal stories.

The third and final day, on 25 October, started with the visit of the Maltav vocational training center in Hulon, which was designed on the model of inter-company vocational training centers in Germany. The group was received by the center's manager, David Bonali, and visited training workshops in metal construction, construction, and fashion design. Immediately afterwards, the final discussion with Israeli participants of the MTDB and the German delegation took place in which the impressions and transfer possibilities were discussed.

5.1 Germany

5.1.1 Language acquisition

In Germany, language acquisition has uppermost priority for refugees. Due to the high demand of German courses in the last two years, especially by refugees, adjustments of the system took place. While in 2014 most people attending integration courses were from EU countries (46.1%), in 2016 the number of Syrian participants rose to 46.9% (see BAMF 2017a). Access to integration courses was opened at the end of 2015 for asylum seekers and tolerated persons (see § 44 residence act). This also changed the focus of action from the attraction of foreign skilled workers to the integration of refugees into society and the labor market (Beckmann-Schulz 2017). The large differences in the level of knowledge among the new language course participants, who previously had no contact with the German culture or language, contribute to poor completion figures of the integration course - a failure rate of up to 60% is attested here (Beckmann-Schulz 2017, see also BAMF 2017b). The long stay in the integration courses presents itself as a challenge for many participants, since the language practice is often absent and vocational preparation measures can only be joined after the language courses. This change was responded to by redesigning the curricula and integrating a focus on occupation in the language courses. New language-supporting measures, such as “KompAS,” have been created by the Federal Employment Agency (Bundesagentur für Arbeit), which should enable faster access to the labor market (Beckmann-Schulz 2017). Occupational language courses from the ESF BAMF program became more important and national vocational language courses (BSK) were launched in 2016 to replace the ESF BAMF courses by 2018 (Beckmann-Schulz 2017). An existing problem is the different German levels and the resulting overlaps in the subsequent language courses and language-supporting measures, which oftentimes can not be optimally implemented due to the performance heterogeneity of the participants (Hochstein 2017). The success factors of job-related German support are an early career orientation, so that the right career path identified and can be pursued accordingly, as well as involvement in society and company, so that the language practice can be guaranteed (Hochstein 2017).
Extensive changes to the previous approach have resulted from experience, such as the large gaps in between language courses that appeared sometimes and the connection between language and practice, which stood in the way of language acquisition. The previous sequencing of courses and measures - first language, then vocational preparation - should be largely integrated or combined, so that direct connections can be made from the language course to practice (Eberle 2017). Previous approaches, such as EQ++, PerF, BSK48, and KompAS, which combine language support to in-company practice or vice versa, are usually characterized by greater success, since motivation is created by establishing an occupational perspective (Hochstein 2017). The following example illustrates this practical approach to language acquisition:

Example: Occupational language course BSK 48 for educators

In 300 h / 6 Units daily job-related German with a focus on education is learned. Thereafter, there are 100 h / 6 UE daily for an intensive exam preparation for “telc B2 for the profession.” Course-specific contents are: learning of target group specific vocabulary, communication with colleagues, parents, authorities, dealing with laws and regulations, background knowledge and specialized vocabulary on the topics.

Topics in education are: early childhood development, social behavior, promotion of interests and pedagogical attitude to norms and values. In addition, topics are social offers and networks, as well as correspondence and documentation.

The curriculum includes 25 lessons each with exercises in communication, vocabulary, and grammar. Here reference is made to the practice of the profession, various institutions and their organizational forms in which an occupation would be possible, work aids, correspondence, networking, funding programs, social media, etc.


5.1.2 Vocational preparation

The vocational preparation measure “perspective for young refugees” (PerjuF Perspektive für junge Flüchtlinge) is designed and funded by the Federal Employment Agency. Carriers include the Chamber of Crafts and other social providers who acquire participants through the local Employment Agency or the Jobcenter. In PerjuF, the objective is to integrate the participants as quickly as possible into companies, so that the measure leads either to an “entry qualification” (EQ Einstiegsqualifizierung) or an apprenticeship / VET (Eberle 2017). Since many refugees particularly lack orientation on the German VET market, the flexibility of the project manager is needed as they search for up to six internships of two weeks instead of the prescribed two internships of six weeks each in order to offer trainees the opportunity to try out several occupations (Heinicke 2017). The good connection of the project manager to the participants and his/her intercultural competence is a not to be underestimated factor for the success – the person who knows his/her participants and their strengths well, has
good chances to transfer them to a suitable company (Heinicke 2017). The work in a real-life company also prepares the participants for upcoming challenges during a VET program. As with the language courses, the heterogeneity of the participants in terms of their language skills is an obstacle to progress of the course (Heinicke 2017). This situation is due to the inappropriate placement of participants - due to the small number of participants, measures oftentimes do not start or take place at all (Heinicke 2017). The lack of participants also impacts other programs and measures - for example, the BMBF-developed program “Occupational Orientation for Refugees” (BOF Berufsorientierung für Flüchtlinge), which should follow PerjuF in the action chain of measures, is hardly feasible (Heinicke 2017). In addition to inappropriate placement, the lack of participants can be traced back to the missing motivation when refugees are mandated to take part in one measure after the next (Heinicke 2017).

“Entry qualification” (EQ) and “entry qualification plus” (EQ +) follow PerjuF or BOF in the chain of measures, but are also popular with participants who have not gone through the previously planned measures. Employers react well to the relatively long test period of 6 to 12 months until the participants go on to start training at the company (Eberle 2017). In many cases, it is possible for the participants to attend vocational school during the EQ, which is a great advantage for the subsequent training, because the everyday procedure at school can be experienced and the material can be learned in advance.

5.2 Israel

5.2.1 Language acquisition

In Israel, certain ways are prearranged for the target groups of language acquisition in Hebrew. The classic group of Jewish immigrants to Israel, the Olim, come via the so-called homecoming (Hebrew: Aliyah) to Israel (Pergament 2017). Once in Israel, they will have the opportunity to stay in an Absorption Center of their choice, which are scattered throughout the country, for the first 6 months of their stay. There are a variety of Ulpan programs for hi-tech participants, for young Olim who want to study in Israel, or older Olim who then receive intensive career guidance (The Jewish Agency for Israel 2017b). These language courses are then linked to a specific absorption center, where they can be accommodated for relatively little cost (The Jewish Agency for Israel 2017a). In these centers, they then attend the basic Ulpan language course. The basic course is carried out for 5 months on 5 days a week for 5 hours a day - this calculation is based on 500 hours (Absorption Center Beit Brodetsky). In addition, up to 10 years after Aliyah, Olim have the opportunity to attend an Ulpan course free of charge (The Jewish Agency for Israel 2017c). Ulpan is the largest language course system in Israel, offering mainly intensive language courses for Olim. Although the model is generally considered successful, it strongly depends on the individual motivation to learn the language. In the case of Olim from the former Soviet Union - over one million people migrated in the 1990s - there is less incentive to integrate into the Hebrew society, because of the formation of their own social structures within the language community (Khanin 2017). In addition to Russian-language newspapers, a Russian-language television station, and a
Russian party, there are significant job offers within the Russian community, which is why this group has lower Hebrew language skills than other Olim (Khanin 2017).

For minorities, the Hebrew language is the basic requirement for access to the labor market (Polachek 2017). Although Hebrew is taught at Arabic schools in Israel starting in elementary school, the language competency of many Arab Israelis is relatively low due to their relative segregation and the low occupational and practical relevance of Hebrew teaching in school (Taha, Heib-Jaljouli 2017). Therefore, in vocational preparation measures, Hebrew language support is an integral part. The VET programs also prioritize the Hebrew language acquisition before English (Eyal Bar-David 2017). Similar challenges exist within other non-Hebrew speaking communities, such as Ethiopian Israelis and Druze.

### 5.2.2 Vocational preparation, guidance and counselling

Vocational preparation in Israel is tailored to the needs of specific target groups. The Olim - Jewish immigrants - are taken care of in the Absorption Center in all respects, and, therefore, the institution is mainly relevant for its accompanying aspect. Every Oleh has a personal contact person who can be contacted directly for any questions. Olim's career path is often planned by Jewish Agency institutions, the oldest and largest organization in the implementation of Aliyah, in the country of origin, or in the Israeli Absorption Center by asking for work experience and desired career path (Pergament 2017). Once the career path has been defined, it will be forwarded to the relevant ministry in the industry, where an according voucher for further education or VET will be issued. The Absorption Center also helps to find an apartment and a workplace. Vocational preparation at the Absorption Center is usually limited to courses for adaptation to Israeli culture, which includes dress code at work and other specificities. The access to the labor market for Olim is often without major hurdles due to their high level of education. Targeted programs are being developed and implemented for certain groups of the Olim who face difficulties in accessing the labor market, such as the ultra-Orthodox Jews (Haredim) (JDC Israel TEVET 2017c) and the Ethiopian Jews (Polachek 2017, Eyal Bar-David 2017, see also JDC Israel TEVET 2017b).

In order to ensure the inclusion of Ethiopian immigrants, vocational preparation programs have been developed, in respect to the prerequisites of this group. Ethiopian immigrants are characterized in particular by a relatively low level of education, which can be traced back to their rural origin. In order to anticipate different developmental tendencies within the heterogeneous group, the training model for Ethiopian immigrants is divided into three stages. In the first level, the Hebrew language acquisition with Ulpan, the entire group takes part. Thereafter, they will be integrated into different paths, where Ulpan graduates will either continue with Level 2 - a technological preparation program - or will be sent directly to VET

---

1 Expressed verbally at Absorption Center by A. Carmel-Kagan on October 24, 2017.
2 Expressed verbally at final discussion by M. Katz, MTDB, on October 25, 2017
3 Expressed verbally at Absorption Center by A. Carmel-Kagan on October 24, 2017.
4 Expressed verbally at Absorption Center by A. Carmel-Kagan on October 24, 2017.
or in-company training, depending on their ability. The technological preparation program is offered in two different versions and lasts 5 months or 724 hours each. In addition to Hebrew and technical-mathematical lessons, the program includes the so-called "multi-purpose workshop." In this "multi-purpose workshop" (240 hours), informal or informally acquired competencies can also be determined practically, allowing a more detailed classification of individuals within the group into different careers based on their abilities. The third and final stage follows the classification of the knowledge and skills, according to which the participants are brought in suitable VET programs. The so-called "long VET" comprises 12 months (1400 hours) of training and trains in the following occupations: mechatronics, furniture specialist, woodworking specialist, woodworking mechanic, electronics technician, goldsmith and other. The "medium VET" lasts 10 months (1100 hours) and trains in professions of textile production, as well as paediatrics teacher, teacher assistance and / or body mechanic. The "short VET" only takes 6 months (800 hours) of training and focuses on the fields of construction and administration / office. (Israeli job titles have been converted into German reference jobs - content is unlikely to be equivalent.) (Polachek 2017)

Moreover, minorities, especially Arab Israelis, are experiencing structural disadvantage that manifests itself socially and economically (Taha, Heib-Jaljouli 2017)). 52% of the Arab community in Israel live below the poverty line, compared to 12% of the Jewish population (JDC Israel TEVET 2017a). The labor market integration, especially of Arab women, is therefore a major task of the Israeli Ministry of Labor, which promotes projects such as the Riyan Centers in Arab-dominated regions in Israel (Eyal Bar-David 2017). Riyan is developed by JDC Israel - TEVET, the Israeli government's largest social research and development service provider, and is operated by Al-Fanar, a nonprofit organization founded by JDC. Riyan is a one-stop shop that reaches out for people in the community. Participants first have a personal conversation to determine their qualifications and desires (Taha, Heib-Jaljouli 2017). The vocational preparation and VET offers are tailored to the target group and the needs of the regional labor market. Arab women start with pre-vocational courses that teach domestic help, such as a revenue-spending calculation, coping with conflicts within the family when starting to work, Hebrew, job application training, and computer skills (Taha, Heib-Jaljouli 2017). Subsequently, a VET program can be started, which ends in an occupation (Taha, Heib-Jaljouli 2017). In addition to the community outreach, the Riyan Center outreach also extends to the companies – raising awareness within the companies to recruit Muslims is argued with the demographical shift making Arab Israelis indispensable as the workforce of the future (Taha, Heib-Jaljouli 2017). The service of the Riyan Center is free of charge, participants can acquire vouchers for vocational preparation or VET programs directly at the center, and also the participants take part in the Riyan Center's programs voluntarily (Taha, Heib-Jaljouli 2017). Riyan Centers are run by community leaders, well-trained professionals from the community (Taha, Heib-Jaljouli 2017). Likewise, the conception and further development of the centers will be designed with the involvement of these Arab professionals, who are
able to consider the cultural characteristics of the target group in the planning. Target-group oriented development of programs in Israel, under the supervision of the Manpower Training & Development Bureau of the Ministry of Labor, Social Services and Affairs, takes place under five guiding principles: “(1) Maximum utilization of the new immigrants potential qualities while taking into account their expectations, in order to facilitate the quickest possible placement, via one of the proposed courses of action. (2) Maximum utilization of the various frameworks already available in the department (3) Development of unique modular frameworks and programs. (4) Prioritization of professions with a high probability of employment. (5) Maximum flexibility in building the preparatory and training programs.” (Polachek 2017). The bureau’s responsibilities include the vocational preparation for Ethiopian Jews described above, as well as integrated services for the Arab-Israeli population, combining language development in Hebrew with basic vocational orientation:

For Arab Israelis, a 500-hour and 700-hour technical or vocational Hebrew language course was developed. Two thirds of the lessons are vocational language learning. In addition, technical vocabulary in the fields of computer, finance, technology is taught. In lower proportions, basic knowledge in mathematics, computer skills and the basics of self-organization are taught. (Polachek 2017)

6. Policy recommendations

The recommendations for action were developed in three steps:

Starting points for the development of recommendations for action take into account the enthusiasm of the German participants for approaches and structures in Israel. The Israeli conditions are then checked for applicability in the German context, to finally come to recommended actions.

6.1 Starting points for the development of recommendations for action

The German participants noticed peculiarities in Israel and they discovered an interestingly successful design and implementation of education and counseling measures, which they see as possible solutions for a transfer. The discussion contributions of the final discussion and statements of the participants form the starting point for the following remarks. It is a concentrate in which an allocation of individual statements is not possible, thus, quotations were not included.

I. Counseling is integrated and begins with the empowerment of the individual.

Counseling forms the common thread and is closely linked with the assistance of Olim (Jewish immigrants) in language courses and, following or in parallel, with vocational preparation or VET courses. A contact person guides the participants continuously from start to fin-

---

8 Expressed verbally by L. Zyser-Yogev, MTDB, during a phone interview on November 9, 2017.
ish, meaning from the time of immigration to the integration into employment. Especially in the beginning, the contact person supports in all matters (bank, health insurance, hospital visit, etc.) (see Absorption Center).

The individual is in the center of attention and the objective is for the individual to be empowered. Reaching the target group by various means is helped by the strong empowerment approach. The involvement of persons (young employees with academic degrees and corresponding experience) from the respective community in responsible positions (management staff, teachers and consultants, etc.) creates role models that contribute to the high level of trust in the community (see Riyan Center). The teachers themselves come from the community and, thus, have good access to the problems that could occur in the life of the participants.

II. No labor market integration without social and cultural integration - a holistic view is the key to success.

In Israel, there is a different attitude towards newcomers. Immigrants are invited to become part of Israeli society (see Aliyah - Return of Jewish people to Israel). In Israel, a positive attitude towards immigrants is noticeable. Identification is handled differently as well – Olim are integrated into society and welcomed. Social integration occurs through arrival and rooting in the country. Unlike in Germany, people oftentimes have connections to the country (social networks, friends, and family).

The Israeli economy needs skilled workers and, therefore, active recruitment is practiced abroad (see Jewish Agency). The image of the Arab Israelis as a new middle class is a positive discourse, which is spread and should lead to social cohesiveness (Arlosorov 2017). Particular importance is placed on the individual career choice. Advertisements for educational opportunities in the community are placed in social media, among other things. The participants voluntarily register for measures.

Vocational guidance and education measures favor a culturally oriented starting point. The measures are geared towards the needs of the respective individual cultural background. According to A. Polacheck, MTDB, the model of success stems from the fact that the methodology and didactics were developed on the basis of cultural peculiarities. This approach had a confidence-building effect. The resulting instruments were then handed to the project staff from the community and their management (Riyan Center), leading to empowerment and self-reliance.

III. Labor market integration with a target-orientation has the highest priority

A quick direct entry into employment is favored. That is the main objective and access to the labor market for immigrants is a given in Israel. A cost-benefit (integration cost) approach highlights the benefits of labor migration as well as integration into the labor market for the Israeli economy. Right at the beginning of the Aliyah, an occupational guidance takes place. After only 5 months of the basic Ulpan language course, integration into companies takes
place. Even while participants are still in the Absorption Center, they are already working, vocational training courses are being held parallel to the course, and a placement in employment will follow immediately thereafter. According to M. Katz, MTDB, two success factors are crucial: housing and work. Israel favors the quick integration into work, because the pride in selfearned wages is enormously important and motivating. A strong target orientation is decisive, but the path – meaning the design and implementation of measures – is flexible.

IV. Demand-orientation and tailor-made training measures characterize the success, offer flexible implementation and more flexibility on site

The starting point for the development of measures is based on the needs and demands of the community and the labor market. Local and regional cultural needs of the community / population are addressed. The labor demand of companies is investigated on-site in order to train skilled workers accordingly. For example, according to local cultural preferences, Arab women can find work locally, so that they can pick up their children from school and be close to the family.

Tailor-made education measures are being developed, which precisely lead to labor market integration and job placement, because requirements are identified and courses developed thereafter, and, thus, there is a concentration on occupations that lead to job placement in the region. The basis is a community-based network of important local actors, which also includes social cultural actors. Israel creates short-term achievements and labor market integration, which are also based on a relatively short training periods, because the duration of the measures is flexible and individually designed.

Flexibility and individuality of the measures are impressive, the structures seem to allow this flexibility. L. Zyser-Yogev, MTDB explains: The Riyan concept is a model that is applied and implemented in different cities for specific target groups. The program design and the management level involve experts from the affected population groups. They participate in advisory boards / steering committees in the design of programs and projects, which means the process is open to change and adaptation from within the community from the very beginning.

V. Language training through early teaching of occupational / technical language, as well as direct use of language in the field of work leads to great success

Employment in the company is given priority over perfecting language skills. An enormous motivating effect is provided by the direct use of the language in the context of company employment. Language proficiency deepens in language practice, the vocabulary expands, and the technical language can be learned at the same time. The direct integration of language courses and vocational training measures ensures the success. The early possibility of employment in companies contributes significantly to the success.
Didactically, the Ulpan concept hardly differs from development of the second language concepts available in Germany. Rather, the use of the second language in everyday life and employment seems to achieve the decisive effects.

6.2 Applicability in the German context

After identifying a range of options for the economic integration of immigrants based on the conclusions of the seminar, a review of transfer options is required to derive feasible policy recommendations. For this purpose, the findings of the seminar will be put in relation with the structures in Germany in order to identify possible obstacles as well as beneficial factors in a country-specific context.

A comparison in the above-described approach of an integrated consultation with the conditions in Germany, leads to the picture of a strongly fragmented system with offers of measures in the fields of consultation, placement and assistance. In addition to the permanent offers in the regular inventory of labor market related services according to the SGB III and SGB II which are placement into VET, vocational training grants (Berufsausbildungsbeihilfe), assisted training (Assistierte Ausbildung), and assistance that is provided during VET (ausbildungsbegleitende Hilfen), there are target group specific offers for immigrants such as the” KAUSA service center”(KAUSA Servicestelle), the “welcome guides” (Willkommenslotsen) and the initiative integration through qualification (IQ Integration durch Qualifizierung). In addition, there are the vocational preparation measures of the transitional system, which are also open to refugees with a corresponding perspective to stay (see Chapter 4.1.1.). The variety of measures, as stated, involves a division of responsibilities between different actors, which makes effective coordination of offers difficult. At the program level, responsibilities of the Federal Ministry of Education and Research (BMBF Bundesministerium für Bildung und Forschung), the Federal Employment Agency (BA Bundesagentur für Arbeit) and the Federal Office for Migration and Refugees (BAMF Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge) coexist, which results in the risk of insufficiently coordinated support activities and, accordingly, poorly coordinated individual measures. To a certain extent, this fragmentation of responsibilities is being neutralized at the level of implementation insofar as the implementation of the various measures on the ground is often the responsibility of the same actors. The chambers (of crafts as well as commerce), together with the employment agencies (Arbeitsagenturen) and job centers (Jobcenter), play a key role in advising immigrants on labor market integration issues, while the actual implementation of integration courses and skills development is in the hands of educational institutions involved in the implementation of regular labor market services. Basically, the potential for an integrated approach of complex interaction of several key players in Germany is evident. Instead of an unrealizable merging of responsibilities at the federal level, better networking of local actors is to be considered, for which the municipal education management offers appropriate starting points (see Stürner 2017).
A holistic immigration policy linking the different dimensions of integration with the objective of sustainable integration into the labor market has long been a priority in Germany. However, as stated in the analysis of the framework conditions, the labor migration of third-country nationals has been rearranged over the past 15 years by the opening of new access routes for skilled workers (see Hinte / Rinne / Zimmermann 2015, pp. 4-10). These access routes have in common that they already require a professional qualification. With regard to immigration for reasons of taking refuge, on the other hand, only recently adequate conditions for access to qualification and employment have been created. For example, recognized refugees and persons admitted to asylum have the same access to the labor market and to VET as nationals; asylum seekers and tolerated persons (“Geduldete”) have access with some limitations (see OECD 2017, pp. 26-27, Granato / Junggeburth 2017, pp. 14-15, see also chap...). In practice, the remaining restrictions such as the three-month access ban on asylum seekers, but above all the unclear perspective to stay for persons who, according to the "3 + 2 rule" (see chap....) have a residence permit (HABEN SIE NICHT!!) for the duration of a vocational training plus a subsequent occupational entry phase of two years, present an obstacle to the qualification of refugees by companies. The inconsistent and sometimes restrictive handling of the relevant provisions by the immigration authorities, which had already been identified as problematical in the course of the literature analysis, was also reflected in the discussion contributions of German seminar participants. These circumstances were stated to be a barrier to the qualification and employment of young people with a refugee background. The labor market and vocational training policy objectives collide in this respect with the residence law framework conditions. With regard to the conditions for integration policy in Germany, it can thus be said that there is already sufficient openness in principle with regard to the general access to training and employment. However, effective implementation is hampered by bureaucratic hurdles and a sometimes restrictive interpretation. There, therefore, is a potential for improvement in administrative procedures.

Addressing cultural peculiarities, which is implemented in Israel, for example, in the culture-sensitive counseling and education offers for the Arab-Israeli population, has a counterpart in the German educational system in the form of the principle of inclusion. This concept, originally aimed at the support of persons with disabilities, provides the basis for integrated learning of all people in regular education and training, rather than traditional training in separate institutions or special classes within schools. The aim is to provide all people with non-discriminatory access to the regular educational offerings of the education system through flexible adaptations to their individual needs (see, for example, Euler / Severing 2014). As a concept for dealing with diversity in general, inclusion can also be groundbreaking for the integration of refugees into the vocational training system. Within the framework of model projects, German vocational training centers already provide culturally specific support services for young refugees, who complete an internship or VET in German companies (see, for example, Breitsame-ter / Gawehns, i.E.: Braun / Stieper, i.). Concerns on the part of the training companies that the special need for support of the target group leads to
an overload of the vocational and socio-pedagogical capacities within companies, can be effectively countered with such forms of cooperation. The positive experiences with a culture-specific design of entire educational programs gained in Israel, can be made fruitful by providing support services that complement regular education courses for the German context.

The further suggestion to enable more individualized learning pathways and to offer specialized short-term programs in addition to complete occupations raises the problem in the German context that the employment system is based on full-time occupations and therefore is not expected to provide long-term benefits below the level of vocational training for the immigrants. Against this background, the Israeli experience does not provide any reason to move away from the accession process to full-time VET, such as entry qualification (EQ Einstiegsqualifizierung). However, a variant of the individualization of learning pathways appropriate to the German context would be the increased use of partial qualifications ("Teilqualifikation") or training modules (see, for example, f-bb 2016), which can support a second chance qualification adapted to individual needs, without abandoning the goal of complete occupations. On the basis that appropriate possibilities for crediting partial qualifications for later training or for taking into account the admission to the external examination are created, a differentiated system of individual learning pathways could be realized on this basis, without questioning the principle of uniform vocational qualifications.

6.3 Recommendations for action

With the thematic focus on the sections of language acquisition and vocational preparation as well as counseling / assistance, the most important phase of integration through qualification measures was selected. The present recommendations for action lie both at the programmatic and at the operational level and address overarching topics of VET and labor market integration. They contain a reinforcement of proven and focus on neglected or still in development design features.
Intensified curricular integration of language acquisition: Integration of general and technical language and practical relevance in language teaching

Occupational language is important and should start earlier in Germany. The concept of integrated subject and language learning, which is designed by the IQ Center for Occupational German and supported with existing practical examples and teaching-learning materials and qualification of teaching staff (see Beckmann-Schulz 2017), already takes this approach of integrated general and specialized language education and should be developed and rolled out.

A sequencing of the BAMF language courses with the BV measures of the employment agency is planned and should result in an integration of both (Eberle 2017). That Language and vocational preparation are not combined in an additive way, but qualitatively by interlinking content. Learning German should become an integral part of vocational competence development (see Beckmann-Schulz 2017).

An operational practice in which the language can be practiced immediately is given in the initial qualification EQ, but should also be strengthened by operational phases in the other BV measures.

In addition, the interlinking of measures should be improved by making them more flexible and better coordinated and contributing to parallel participation in language courses and action. Examples of the gearing are already initiated, but could be strengthened nationwide. In Berlin, for example, job-related language courses are preferred and integrated into vocational school classes.
Access to the labor market and differentiated arrangement of individual educational paths

One important suggestion relates to the reduction of successive educational measures. The path of qualification, which is proposed in Germany, is very long: in advance, vocational / general school education and language acquisition, then vocational orientation and specific measures of vocational preparation for refugees, and next to be admitted to “entry qualification” (Einstiegsqualifizierung EQ) in order to then enter into the extended VET or extra-company (vocational) education and training (see Esser et al. 2017). The expansion of the length of stay in the transitional and vocational training system is neither motivating for the target group, nor is the extensive public support and long-term reliance on welfare met with acceptance by the general population.

An individualized approach should be improved in Germany. A differentiated approach depending on the educational prerequisites is required and early access to the labor market should be examined and differentiated depending on the residential status and the perspective to stay (Bleibeperspektive). Modular concepts leading to vocational qualifications but involving employment in a company should be reinforced.

Israel grants quick access to the labor market, Sweden and Austria also favor swift employment, which is in line with the desire of the immigrants to take up work (see Esser et al. 2017).

Individual examples show alternative ways of second chance qualification, which is directly related to work acceptance and merit. At Vespe e.V., a partial qualification project with refugees, in which they earn 13.50 euros / h, will be carried out with WeGebAU funding.

Continuous counseling and assistance by one person of contact

Empowerment and enabling is also important in Germany. Coaching of the immigrants, which promotes the own competency to act, from the entry into educational measures up to the entrance into employment, should be installed. A lasting consultation and assistance seems to be particularly effective. Only one person of contact assisting the transitional and training process of the individual participant, is also supported by 90% of the interviewed participants of the BIBB expert monitor (see Esser et al., 2017). Long-term counseling and coaching concepts should be expanded and strengthened.

Regional and local needs assessment and flexible design of educational offers

Demand orientation and tailor-made offers oriented towards the demand enthused the participants. The current measures for immigrants use the existing instruments of pre-vocational training with for example specific characteristics for refugees. At the moment, the adjustment to local needs is not sufficient; rather, a quick offer is to be created through the introduction of educational measures. The orientation in the design of measures should change and be developed from the perspective of local needs. An exploration of the flexibility and scope of the types of measures could support local actors. Controlled needs assessment involving the
economy and employment agency, and the active involvement of migrant actors could generate new design options.

Pooling and interlocking of measures were perceived as particularly effective. The formation of support chains and the coordination and management of local measures are considered to be particularly necessary (see Esser et al., 2017). When it comes to coordinating educational opportunities, local communities have to be involved. Municipalities with existing transition management are clearly in the advantage.

Good examples are available - their practice could be communicated more sufficiently and spread to be a model: Job centers create knowledge transfer among themselves and are now more flexible in their scope. The actors have come together and it has sometimes been possible to create short paths. For example, a “guiding agency” (Lotsenhaus) at the Employment Agency in Barnim was established, where processes were simplified, bundled and there is a direct discourse among the institutions, which work together in order to find solutions, instead of not taking responsibility.

A participatory, culturally-oriented approach for the design of educational offerings would meet the needs of the target groups more equitable

In Israel it becomes clear that integration processes need more flexibility. The KAUSA service centers implement an empowerment and participatory approach. A participatory approach is important, so migrant organizations and migrant NGOs could be more involved in the implementation of labor market integration. The approach of role models, a professional from the community, could be strengthened in Germany.

Strengthen the KAUSA approach as a model
The KAUSA service centers offer nationwide training support for migrant training companies. KAUSA Refugee supports companies in hiring refugees. The KAUSA contacts and the existing trust could be developed and used to involve entrepreneurs and professionals with a migrant background, actors of migrant organizations in shaping labor market integration. Actors (researchers, pedagogues, etc.) with a migration background, dedicated migrant companies with knowledge of the community should be involved in program advisory councils and steering committees.

Increase multiplier advanced training and involve educators from the community in the development of culture-oriented didactic concepts

Connection to the living environment is a didactic principle, which is taken into account in the support of disadvantaged people within the scope of a target-group-specific methodology and didactics, and has special significance in all concepts of measures as well. Didactics of inclusion that incorporate the diversity of individuals is still emerging in Germany and is still in its infancy in vocational education and training. Didactics, that take into account the cultural background of the participants, as practiced in Israel, would still have to be developed. "The objective of pedagogical action rather is the best possible consideration of indi-
individual conditions, possibilities, and needs, that is, the personal characteristics of the individual. Accordingly, the training of refugees requires that trainers pay attention to the individual’s personality, but also to know specific aspects of their life situation, such as the family situation, the legal status, their living, and, thus, learning conditions, in order to understand behavior not hastily resorting to cultural patterns of explanation. “(see Bethscheider 2016)

Social integration has two directions: to include and acknowledge the cultural background of the minority community of the participants, and to get to know and recognize the cultural community of the German majority society. The debate over value systems and the integration into the immigration society are part of it.

The need for social inclusion should be addressed sufficiently by meeting the local needs of people and taking account cultural particularities in the creation of measures. The social networks from the respective communities in Germany should be included as well. Involvement in the German community is important for integration, as demonstrated by the example of volunteers in Germany, especially those who are retired. Integration on a personal level should be intensified by building tandem structures.

The handling and significance of intercultural competency is part of the program lines, such as the program “Vocational Orientation for Refugees” (Berufsorientierung für Flüchtlinge BOF) of the Ministry of Education and Research (Bundesministerium für Bildung und Forschung BMBF). It is necessary to strengthen intercultural competency in VET in the current situation of integration of immigrants. Therefore, intercultural competency will be required for trainers in companies and vocational school teachers (see foraus.de 2017).

In Germany, trainers and social pedagogues with a migration background are part of the training team, as well as street workers with a migration background work who work in the community. These specialists use their intercultural competencies for their considerable pedagogical benefit in their daily work. "So it pays to have a close look at the competencies of skilled workers and trainees with a migration background in order to discover and promote skills that they have in addition to their specialist knowledge acquired during the training."

(Settelmeyer / Hoffmann 2007)

Educational specialists with a migration background should be explicitly involved in the conceptual design of measures in order to ensure a culture-oriented, target group-oriented didactic implementation.

**Strengthen support for companies**

The Israeli as well as the German side favor a strengthening of practical work in companies during vocational education and training. A prerequisite for this is an orientation on the company’s needs, and a matching process with the participants and companies. The approach in Germany should determine even more the needs of the companies and ask the competencies and work / career aspirations of the refugees to ensure a better fit.
The transition into vocational training, for example after completing a PerjuF course, could be improved. Apprenticeship placement could be more directly coordinated by the Employment Agency and the Chambers with the prospective companies and graduates of measures to ensure the smoothest possible transition.

Examples already exist: Welcome guides (Willkommenslotsen) assist small and medium-sized enterprises in filling open training and employment opportunities with refugees. The company support agency Brandenburg (bea-Brandenburg) advises and assists the employment and training process individually. Depending on the needs and demands of the company, internal training courses are conceptualized and implemented, mentors are trained or various event formats, for example matching, are carried out.

**Convincing by good practice – communication and dissemination**

Examples of good practice in Israel (company from the community) and in Germany (companies that integrate refugees) show that workplace access and employment contribute to reducing prejudice. Training of employees and managers, as well as the trainers in companies for the integration of immigrants, diversity of competencies, and intercultural competencies supports this process.

However, companies need to be more persuasive in order to make this strategy a success. Campaigns, awards or competitions as well as communicating stories and new faces in the company could show what companies can do and how open they are to offering immigrants perspectives.

Vocational training could proactively contribute to positive attitudes towards immigrants. VET stands for diversity. The world of work has long been diverse with colleagues who bring in different skills. More conviction of companies and society should be created through good practice. The BMBF could launch a targeted campaign (see Jobstarter 2010) to visualize role models with a migration background in various professional positions.

**Interdisciplinary and interinstitutional stakeholder conferences of the federal, federal state, and local level to identify overarching need for action and participative control of required solutions**

Coordinating rounds at the local level have tackled the steering and integration of local measures. This task contains extensive challenges that have to be overcome (see Stürner 2017).

The composition of the German delegation was seen as a professional gain as representatives of the programmatic and operational level offered the possibility of an intensive exchange and an analysis of the German funding structure and practice. The mutual exchange of experiences enabled new perspectives and the identification of additional success factors.
References


http://www.afikim.org/


BMAS (Bundesministerium für Arbeit und Soziales (BMAS) (2017). Profil und spezifische Expertise der Netzwerke im Handlungsschwerpunkt IvAF. Bonn: BMAS.


Photo protocol of discussion during the seminar: Integration of immigrants and populations in VET and employment in Israel and Germany, Tel Aviv, Israel, 23-25 October 2017.


Project profiles of presented and visited projects during the seminar: Integration of immigrants and populations in VET and employment in Israel and Germany, Tel Aviv, Israel, 23-25 October 2017.


Seminar program: Integration of immigrants and populations in VET and employment in Israel and Germany, Tel Aviv, Israel, 23-25 October 2017.


Synopsis Germany (EN): file “2_Synopsis Germany_EN.pdf”

Synopsis Israel (EN): file “3_Synopsis Israel_EN.pdf”
